

Comments on
„Employment Effects of Short and Medium Term
Further Training Programs in Germany in the
Early 2000s“

M. Biewen, B. Fitzenberger, A. Osikominu, and M. Waller

Stephan L. Thomsen
ZEW, Mannheim

3rd Conference on Evaluation Research, Mannheim
Oct. 28, 2006

Summary

- Paper analyzes the effects of different types of training programs in Germany
 - Evaluation approach incorporates the multiple treatment framework in a dynamic context
 - Analysis is based upon data on inflows into unemployment between Feb 00 and Jan 02
- Employment data end in Dec 2003

Results

West:

- Estimates show positive effects for both gender in STT
- CFT increases employment chances (persons with 6+ months of unemp.)
- Effectiveness tends to be larger for programs starting/persons joining later within the unemployment spell

East:

- Moderate positive effects for STT for men (with 6+ months of unemp.)
- Moderate positive effects for CFT for men (with 0+ months of unemp.)

Remarks (1)

1) Description of Programs

Add some discussion . . .

- . . . on the expected effects of those programs
- . . . on the incentives of caseworkers to choose persons/of persons to participate
- . . . on experiences with these programs from Germany and other countries

Remarks (2)

2) Data

Descriptions of the data are very carefully, but ...

- ... central aspects of the empirical analysis are noted in footnotes, the appendix or missing.
Examples: the size of the observation window, the number of observations before and/or even after imposing the restrictions, the definition of programs (differs from the institutional description)
- ... maybe a data appendix could be useful providing the details of the extensive and careful checking of the data

Remarks (3)

3) Structure

There are two main aspects in the paper, ...

- ... a comprehensive methodological part and a clearly shorter applied part.

The aim of this paper is applied work, ...

- ... you should present more results, e.g. tables of estimates, some indicators for quality etc.
- ... maybe you should split the paper!