

# The Productivity Effects of Information Communication Technology

### Tim De Stefano OECD, University of Nottingham

Richard Kneller and Jonathan Timmis *GEP, University of Nottingham* 







- Emerging consensus of ICT as a 'general purpose technology'
- Bloom, Garicano, Van Reenan argue that ICT is not a homogenous capital
- The effects of ICT are distinct, depending on whether they affect information communication versus storage and processing
- We explore the sales, employment and productivity effects of communication-ICT

- Concerned by endogeneity bias
- Instruments based on telephone network infrastructure
- 5,630 Telephone exchange in UK
- Instrument 1: 0/1 indicator of TE if ADSL enabled if enabled in wave 1
- Instrument 2: Local Loop Distance
- Connection speeds deteriorate for cable-distances >2km. Max 3.5km
- Telephone quality okay up to 16km.
- Mid-2001, BT introduces RADSL technology – connection now up to 5.5km.
- Median (25<sup>%</sup>, 75<sup>%</sup>, 99<sup>%</sup>) distance
  2.92km (2.01km, 4.10km, 6.02km)
- Wave 1 1999-2002; first 20% of exchanges



**Cable Distance and Internet Speed** 



#### **UK telephone network**

### TEs Enabled by the end of 2002 (wave 1)



The University of

UNITED KINGDOM · CHINA · MALAYSIA



ADSL Enablement Date

Location of TEs in Nottingham





#### **Do Instruments Matter for ICT?**



UNITED KINGDOM · CHINA · MALAYSIA

- ONS data on ICT capital stock. CiTDB data on ICT hardware and software
- First stage regressions for ICT use in year 2000 for firms who were connected to TEs enabled before end-2002
- Attached to ADSL enabled TE increases ICT, PCs but not software
- Greater cable distance reduces this

Sample	Year: 2000; Exchanges Enabled in Wave 1 (1999-2002)							
ICT Variable	ICT Capital Stock	ERP software	ERP & Sales Software	PCs/ Emp.	Portable PCs/ Emp.	Pentium PCs/ Emp.		
ADSL Enabled	0.908***	-0.004	-0.049	0.347***	0.494***	0.323***		
Exchange	(0.171)	(0.030)	(0.040)	(0.080)	(0.120)	(0.090)		
Loop distance*	-0.382***	-0.013	0.034	-0.201***	-0.298***	-0.199***		
ADSL Enabled	(0.142)	(0.020)	(0.030)	(0.060)	(0.100)	(0.070)		
Observations	3,331	4,830	4,831	4,830	3,281	4,686		

#### Dependent variable: ICT

### **Instrument Validity**



UNITED KINGDOM · CHINA · MALAYSIA

- Objections to the instrument
  - Local loops are not randomly assigned
  - Other confounding factors are correlated with firm performance other than through broadband adoption
- Arguably unobserved geographic & firm factors may be important
- Provide evidence for
  - Introduction of RADSL
  - control for region dummies, no. households, no. businesses
  - Pre-ADSL firm characteristics (data from 1998)

Exchanges	ADSL Enabled Exchanges				Non-Enabled Exchanges				
Enabled in					Wave 1	Wave 1	Wave 1	Wave 2&3	
Year	2000	2001	2002	2003	1998	1999	2000	2000	
ICT Variable	ICT Capital Stock				ICT Capital Stock				
Loop Distance *	-0.336***	-0.250***	-0.169***	-0.151***	-0.129	0.184	0.065	0.159	
ADSL enabled	(0.093)	(0.063)	(0.057)	(0.053)	(0.352)	(0.171)	(0.106)	(0.110)	

#### Dependent variable: ICT

#### Main Results: Aggregate ICT and Performance



UNITED KINGDOM · CHINA · MALAYSIA

Dependent Variable	Out	put	Emplo	yment	TFP		
Exchanges	All Wave 1	Enabled By 2000	All Wave 1	Enabled By 2000	All Wave 1	Enabled By 2000	All
Second Stage							
ICT Capital Stock	0.605***	0.471***	0.399***	0.399**	0.014	-0.158	0.058
	(0.072)	(0.115)	(0.065)	(0.120)	(0.092)	(0.107)	(0.042)
First Stage							
ADSL Enabled	0.908***		0.908***		0.908***		0.969***
Exchange	(0.171)		(0.171)		(0.171)		(0.143)
Loop distance	-0.382***	-0.336***	-0.382***	-0.336***	-0.382***	-0.336***	-0.414***
*ADSL Enabled	(0.142)	(0.093)	(0.142)	(0.093)	(0.142)	(0.093)	(0.122)
Cragg-Donald F	21 002	12 699	21 002	12 699	21 002	12 699	11 796
Test	21.005	15.000	21.005	15.000	21.005	15.000	41.780
Kleibergen-Paap	22.240	12.026	22.240	12.026	22.240	12.026	40 502
F Test	22.249	12.920	22.249	12.920	22.249	12.920	40.505
Hansen J Statistic	0.504		0.604		0.545		0.083
Observations	3331	2290	3331	2290	3331	2290	4807

#### Main Results: Types of ICT and Revenue



UNITED KINGDOM · CHINA · MALAYSIA

Dependent Variable	Revenue							
Exchanges	All Wave 1	Enabled By 2000	All Wave 1	Enabled By 2000	All Wave 1	Enabled By 2000		
Second Stage								
PCs per employee	1.425***	1.904***						
	(0.424)	(0.402)						
Portable PCs			1.137***	1.186***				
per employee			(0.342)	(0.275)				
Pentium PCs					1.740***	2.181***		
per employee					(0.569)	(0.527)		
First Stage								
ADSL Enabled	0.347***		0.494***		0.323***			
Exchange	(0.078)		(0.123)		(0.089)			
Loop Distance	-0.201***	-0.225***	-0.298***	-0.305***	-0.199***	-0.203***		
*ADSL Enabled	(0.061)	(0.033)	(0.097)	(0.053)	(0.070)	(0.038)		
Cragg-Donald F Test	12.948	47.418	9.067	33.619	7.55	28.544		
Kleibergen-Paap F Test	12.339	46.588	9.382	33.332	7.318	28.313		
Hansen J Statistic	0.166		0.346		0.335			
Observations	4,830	3,276	3,281	2,246	4,686	3,169		

# **Discussion & Conclusions**



- This paper considers whether communication-ICT affects the performance of UK firms
- We use an IV approach that uses communications-network infrastructure
- Find that instruments behave as expected and pass standard tests for instrument validity
- Find a strong effect on employment and revenue but not TFP.

## Acknowledgements



 This work was based on data from the Annual Respondent Database, the E-Commerce and ITIS Database, produced by the Office for National Statistics (ONS) and supplied by the Secure Data Service at the UK Data Archive. The data are Crown Copyright and reproduced with the permission of the controller of HMSO and Queen's Printer for Scotland. The use of the data in this work does not imply the endorsement of ONS or the Secure Data Service at the UK Data Archive in relation to the interpretation or analysis of the data. This work uses research datasets which may not exactly reproduce National Statistics aggregates. In addition this research used data from them ICT Capital Stock Dataset provided by the VML.