Web appendix for

Debt Rule Federalism: The Case of Germany

Sarah Ciaglia (Federal Ministry of Finance)

Friedrich Heinemann (ZEW Mannheim and University of Heidelberg)

October 2012

Cate	egories			f Rule	-	Total Points	Std. Points
Des	cription	Basic rule BBR: balanced budget	Regulations "in principle" no borrowing,	Relaxations Borrowing above	Sanctions A fourth of the		
	a. Paol	BBN Bulliced Budget	max. borrowing equal to the amount of expenditures for investments in order to respond to "demands of the macroeconomic equilibrium" or similar severe situations	investments-clause allowed in order to respond to a "disturbance of the macroeconomic equilibrium"	Parliament's members or the government can take the budget to the constitutional court; Stability Council monitors enforcement, if a budgetary emergency occurs, the Council sets up and monitors the financial		
		DR: max. nominal credit market debt stock	Not exceed "permanently" nominal credit market debt stock of 2007, higher debt stock allowed if tax income decreases by 1% from one year to another, simulatneously decide a redemption plan for max. 7 years	catastrophes or similar severe emergencies, simulatneously decide a redemption plan for max. 7 years	restructuring programme		
A	Legal base	BBR: constitution Art. 79 (1) sentence 2, LHO Art. 18 (1); DR: LHO Art. 18 (1)	BBR: constitution Art. 79, LHO Art. 18 (1) and Art. 26; DR: LHO Art. 18 (1)	BBR: constitution Art. 84 sentence 2, LHO Art. 18 (2); DR: LHO Art. 18 (2) and (3)	Constitution Art. 68 (2) No 2; Stability Council: Federal constitution Art. 109a sentence 1 No 2, StabiRatG	13 / 16	0,81
В	Enforcement mechanisms				There are no specific sanctions (valid for every bill), the Stability Council only monitors the enforcement but cannot sanction defections or impose corrective measures	1 / 4	0,25
	Coverage Official budget: - shareholdings - debt claims by public authorities - granted loans - reserves Public enterprises		1,75 0,75 1 1 1 0			1,75 / 4 0,75 / 1	0,44 0,75
	Special funds Financial support for local authorities		0			0 / 1 1 / 1	0,00 1,00
D	Flexibility Business cycle Economic shocks Other emergencies Compensational mechanism		1 1	1 1 1		4 / 4 1 / 1 1 / 1 1 / 1 1 / 1	1,00 1,00 1,00 1,00 1,00
	Content Clear definitions	2	business cycle fluctuations: "demands of the macroeconomic equilibrium", also "similar severe situations") Investments: 1 (vague definition in LHO Art. 13 (3) No 2 sentence 2) Debt stock in 2007: 2 (definititve numerical	general understanding, use must be justified) Similar severe emergencies: 1 (not specified, but use must be justified) Redemption plan: 2 (clear definition of time span and	Legal provisions are clearly defined		0,75
	Strict aim		value) Permanently: 2 (referring to "tax income decrease", but time span not soecified) Redemption plan: 2 (clear definition of time span and amount of debt that must be payed back)		2 0	6 / 6 2 / 6	1,00 0,33
	Strict rule	2			1	7 / 8	0,88
					Sum Index score	34,75 / 48	0,65

Categories			of Rule		Total Points	Std. Points
	Basic rule	Regulations	Relaxations	Sanctions		
Description	BBR: balanced budget	"regularly" no borrowing, max. borrowing equal to the amount of expenditures for investments in case of "extraordinary demands" ("demands of the macroeconomic equilibrium" or similar severe situations)	Borrowing above investments-clause allowed in order to respond to a "disturbance of the macroeconomic equilibrium"	Majority of the Parliament's members can take the budget to the constitutional court; Stability Council monitors enforcement, if a budgetary emergency occurs, the Council sets up and monitors the financial restructuring programme		
A Legal base	BayHO Art. 18 (1)	BayHO Art. 18 (1)	Constitution Art. 82, BayHO Art. 18 (2)	(1); Stability Council: Federal constitution Art. 109a sentence 1 No 2, StabiRatG	12 / 16	0,7!
B Enforcement mechanisms				There are no specific sanctions (valid for every bill), the Stability Council only monitors the enforcement but cannot sanction defections or impose corrective measures		0,2!
C Coverage Official budget: - shareholdings - debt claims by publi authorities - granted loans - reserves Public enterprises Special funds Financial support for local authorities	c	1,75 0,75 1 1 1 0 0 0			0 / 1 0 / 1 1 / 1	0,44 0,7! 0,00 0,00 1,00
D Flexibility Business cycle Economic shocks Other emergencies Compensational mechanism		1 1			3 / 4 1 / 1 1 / 1 1 / 1 0 / 1	0,7! 1,0(1,0(1,0(0,0(
E Content Clear definitions		Borrowing: 2 (speficied in HGrG) Regularly: 0 (referring to business cycle fluctuations: "demands of the macroeconomic equilibrium" and "similar severe situations", measurement not specified) Investments: 1 (vague definition in BayHO Art. 13 (3) No 2 sentence 2)	Disturbance of the macroeconomic equilibrium: 0 (not specified)	3 Legal provisions are clearly defined	6 / 20	0,3(
Strict aim Strict rule		1 0 1	0	0	3 / 8	0,50 0,00 0,38
				Sum	23,75 / 48	

Cat	egories		Part o	of Rule		Total Points	Std. Points
	_	Basic rule	Regulations	Relaxations	Sanctions		
Des	scription	BBR balanced budget	If there are no other financial means to cover expenditures, borrowing is allowed up until an amount equal to the amount of expenditures for investments	Borrowing above investments-clause allowed in order to respond to a "disturbance of the macroeconomic equilibrium"	A fourth of the Parliament's members or the government can take the budget to the constitutional court; Stability Council monitors enforcement, if a budgetary emergency occurs, the Council sets up and monitors the financial restructuring programme		
		BBR (KonsHilfG): numerical limits for structural deficit until 2019 ER: max. yearly increase of expenditures of 0,3%	along chain Max. increase of expenditures of 0,3% per year referring to year	Structural deficit above limits allowed in case of exceptional situations (must be approved by the Stability Council)	Financial Support is cut off if Stability Council considers limits exceeded		
A	Legal base	BBR: constitution Art. 87, KonsHilfG Art. 2, VV KonsHilfG Art. 4; ER: mid- term budget plan	before BBR: constitution Art. 87, LHO Art. 18, KonsHilfG Art. 2, VV KonsHilfG; ER: mid- term budget plan	BBR: constitution Art. 87, LHO Art. 18, VV KonsHilfG Art. 6	Constitution Art. 84 (2) No 3, VV KonsHilfG Art. 8; Stability Council: Federal constitution Art. 109a sentence 1 No 2, StabiRatG	12 / 16	0,75
В	Enforcement mechanisms				Financial support is cut off, implicit obligation for corrective measures	3 / 4	0,75
С	Coverage Official budget: - shareholdings - debt claims by public authorities - granted loans		1,75 0,75 1 1			1,75 / 4 0,75 / 1	0,44 0,75
	- reserves Public enterprises Special funds Financial support for local authorities		0 0 0 1			0 / 1 0 / 1 1 / 1	0,00 0,00 1,00
D	Flexibility Business cycle Economic shocks Other emergencies Compensational mechanism		0			2 / 4 0 / 1 1 / 1 1 / 1 0 / 1	0,50 0,00 1,00 1,00 0,00
E	Content Clear definitions	2	6 Borrowing: 2 (defined by structural deficit)	Disturbance of the macroeconomic equilibrium: 1 (not specified, but the disturbance and that borrowing will help to repel it must be defined by law)	5 Legal provisions are clearly defined	17 / 20	0,85
			Investments: 1 (vague definition in LHO Art. 13 (3) No 2 sentence 2) Structural deficit: 2 (clear definition and method for	Exceptional situations: 0 (not specified, Stability Council is free to determine a situation as exceptionnal)			
i	Strict aim		calculation in VV KonsHilfG) Expenditures: 1 (not sure if LHO Art. 13 (4) No 2 applies) 2		2	5 / 6 4 / 6	0,83 0,67
i	Strict rule	2	1		2	8 / 8	1,00
		1	1	l .	Sum	35,75 / 48	

BE - from 2020 on

Categories			Part o	of Rule		Total Points	Std. Points
		Basic rule	Regulations	Relaxations	Sanctions	+	
Description		BBR balanced budget	If there are no other financial means to cover expenditures, borrowing is	Borrowing above investments-clause allowed in order to respond to a "disturbance of the macroeconomic equilibrium"	Parliament 's members or the government can take the budget to the constitutional court; Stability Council monitors enforcement, if a budgetary emergency occurs, the Council sets up and monitors the financial restructuring programme		
A Legal bas	se	BBR: constitution Art. 87	BBR: constitution Art. 87, LHO Art. 18	BBR: constitution Art. 87, LHO Art. 18	Constitution Art. 84 (2) No 3; Stability Council: Federal constitution Art. 109a sentence 1 No 2, StabiRatG		1,00
B Enforcen mechanis					There are no specific sanctions (valid for every bill), the Stability Council only monitors the enforcement but cannot sanction defections or impose corrective measures	1 / 4	0,25
C Coverage Official bu - shareho - debt cla authoritie: - granted - reserve: Public ent Special fu	dget: oldings sims by public s l loans s erprises		1,75 0,75 1 1 1 0 0			1,75 / 4 0,75 / 1 0 / 1 0 / 1	0,44 0,75 0,00 0,00
Financial s	support for		1			1 / 1	1,00
D Flexibility Business of Economic Other eme Compensation	y cycle shocks ergencies ational		0			1 / 4 0 / 1 1 / 1 0 / 1 0 / 1	0,25 0,00 1,00 0,00 0,00
E Content Clear defir		1	Borrowing: 2 (speficied in HGrG) Investments: 1 (vague definition in LHO Art. 13 (3)	Disturbance of the macroeconomic equilibrium: 1 (not specified, but the disturbance and that borrowing will help to repel it must be defined by law)	3 Legal provisions are clearly defined	7 / 20	0,35
Strict aim Strict rule		1	No 2 sentence 2) 2 0 0	0			0,83 0,00 0,25
					Index score	20,73 / 40	0,46

Categories		Part o	of Rule		Total Points	Std. Points
	Basic rule	Regulations	Relaxations	Sanctions		
Description	BBR: Balanced budget	Max. borrowing equal to	Borrowing above investments-clause allowed in order to respond to a "disturbance of the macroeconomic equilibrium"	A fifth of the Parliament's members or the government can take the budget to the constitutional court; Stability Council monitors enforcement, if a budgetary emergency occurs, the Council sets up and monitors the financial restructuring programme		
A Legal base	Constitution Art. 101 (2) sentence 4	Constitution Art. 103 (1) sentence 2 and Art. 101 (1), LHO Art. 18 (1)	Constitution Art. 103 (1) sentence 3	Constitution Art. 68(2) No 2; Stability Council: Federal constitution Art. 109a sentence 1 No 2, StabiRatG	16 / 16	1,00
B Enforcement mechanisms				There are no specific sanctions (valid for every bill), the Stability Council only monitors the enforcement but cannot sanction defections or impose corrective measures	1 / 4	0,2
C Coverage Official budget: - shareholdings - debt claims by public authorities - granted loans - reserves Public enterprises Special funds Financial support for local authorities		1,75 0,75 1 1 1 0 0 0			0 / 1 0 / 1 1 / 1	0,4 0,7 0,0 0,0 0,0 1,0
D Flexibility Business cycle Economic shocks Other emergencies Compensational mechanism		1 1			2 / 4 1 / 1 1 / 1 0 / 1 0 / 1	0,56 1,0 1,0 0,0 0,0
E Content Clear definitions	1	Borrowing: 2 (speficied in HGrG) Investments: 2 (definition in LHO Art. 13 (3) No 2 sentence 2 and VV-HH 3.2.1.1) Natural living conditions: 1 (not specified but explicitely related to nature)	Disturbance of the macroeconomic equilibrium: 1 (not specified, but the disturbance and that borrowing will help to repel it must be defined by law)	Legal provisions are clearly defined		0,4!
Strict aim Strict rule	1	2 2 0	0			0,8 0,3 0,2

	BR: balanced budget	the amount of expenditures for investments	Relaxations Borrowing above investments-clause allowed in order to respond to a "disturbance of the macroeconomic equilibrium"	Sanctions A fifth of the Parliament's members, the government or another institution under public law can take the budget to the constitutional court; Stability Council monitors enforcement, if a		
Description BE	-	the amount of expenditures for investments	investments-clause allowed in order to respond to a "disturbance of the macroeconomic	members, the government or another institution under public law can take the budget to the constitutional court; Stability Council monitors enforcement, if a		
				budgetary emergency occurs, the Council sets up and monitors the financial restructuring programme		
lin ur	ntil 2019	along chain	Structral deficit above limits allowed in case of exceptional situations (must be approved by the Stability Council)	Financial Support is cut off if Stability Council considers limits exceeded		
se	entence 2, KonsHilfG Art. , VV KonsHilfG Art. 4	Constitution Art. 131a sentence 2, LHO Art. 18 (1), KonsHilfG Art. 2, VV KonsHilfG	Constitution Art. 131a sentence 2, LHO Art. 18 (1), VV KonsHilfG Art. 6	Constitution Art. 140 (1); Stability Council: Federal constitution Art. 109a sentence 1 No 2, StabiRatG, VV KonsHilfG Art. 8	12 / 16	0,7
B Enforcement mechanisms				Financial support is cut off, implicit obligation for corrective measures	3 / 4	0,7
C Coverage Official budget: - shareholdings - debt claims by public authorities - granted loans - reserves		1,75 0,75 1 1 1 0			1,75 / 4 0,75 / 1	0,4 0,7
Public enterprises Special funds Financial support for local authorities		0			0 / 1	0,0
D Flexibility Business cycle Economic shocks Other emergencies Compensational		0	1 1 0		2 / 4 0 / 1 1 / 1 1 / 1 0 / 1	0,5 0,0 1,0 1,0 0,0
mechanism E Content Clear definitions		HGrG) Investments: 1 (vague definition in LHO Art. 13 (3) No 2 sentence 2) Structural deficit: 2 (clear definition and method for	Disturbance of the macroeconomic equilibrium: 0 (not specified) Exceptional situations: 0	Legal provisions are clearly defined Exceeded limit: 2 (numerical definition, but: vulnerable to interpretation	16 / 20	0,80
Strict aim Strict rule	2	calculation in VV KonsHilfG) 2 2 2	0 1 2	1	4 / 6 4 / 6 8 / 8 34,75 / 48	0,6 0,6 1,0

HB - from 2020 on

Description BBR: I	R: balanced budget	Regulations Max. borrowing equal to the amount of expenditures for investments Constitution Art. 131a sentence 2, LHO Art. 18 (1)	in order to respond to a "disturbance of the macroeconomic equilibrium" Constitution Art. 131a	Sanctions A fifth of the Parliament's members, the government or another institution under public law can take the budget to the constitutional court; Stability Council monitors enforcement, if a budgetary emergency occurs, the Council sets up and monitors the financial restructuring programme Constitution Art. 140 (1); Stability Council: Federal constitution Art. 109a	16 / 16	1,00
A Legal base Constisenter B Enforcement	estitution Art. 131a tence 2	Max. borrowing equal to the amount of expenditures for investments Constitution Art. 131a sentence 2, LHO Art. 18 (1)	Borrowing above investments-clause allowed in order to respond to a "disturbance of the macroeconomic equilibrium"	A fifth of the Parliament's members, the government or another institution under public law can take the budget to the constitutional court; Stability Council monitors enforcement, if a budgetary emergency occurs, the Council sets up and monitors the financial restructuring programme Constitution Art. 140 (1); Stability Council: Federal		1,00
senter B Enforcement	tence 2	sentence 2, LHO Art. 18 (1)		Stability Council: Federal	16 / 16	1,00
	·		4	sentence 1 No 2, StabiRatG		
				There are no specific sanctions (valid for every bill), the Stability Council only monitors the enforcement but cannot sanction defections or impose corrective measures	1 / 4	0,25
C Coverage Official budget: - shareholdings - debt claims by public authorities - granted loans - reserves Public enterprises Special funds Financial support for local authorities		1,75 0,75 1 1 1 0 0 0			0 / 1 0 / 1 1 / 1	0,44 0,75 0,00 0,00 1,00
D Flexibility Business cycle Economic shocks Other emergencies Compensational mechanism		0			1 / 4 0 / 1 1 / 1 0 / 1 0 / 1	0,25 0,00 1,00 0,00 0,00
E Content Clear definitions		Borrowing: 2 (speficied in HGrG) Investments: 1 (vague definition in LHO Art. 13 (3) No 2 sentence 2)	Disturbance of the macroeconomic equilibrium: 0 (not specified)	Legal provisions are clearly defined		0,30
Strict aim Strict rule	1	2	0	0	, -	0,67 0,00 0,25

Cate	egories		Part o	of Rule		Total Points	Std. Points
		Basic rule	Regulations	Relaxations	Sanctions		
Des	cription	BBR: balanced budget	Max. borrowing equal to the amount of expenditures for investments	Borrowing above investments-clause allowed in case of "extraordinary demands" (LHO: "disturbance of the macroeconomic equilibrium")	A fifth of the Parliament's members or the government can take the budget to the constitutional court; Stability Council monitors enforcement, if a budgetary emergency occurs, the Council sets up and monitors the financial restructuring programme		
A	Legal base	Constitution Art. 66 (1) sentence 2	Constitution Art. 72 (1), LHO Art. 18 (1)	Constitution Art. 72 (1), LHO Art. 18 (1)	Constitution Art. 65 (3) No 3; Stability Council: Federal constitution Art. 109a sentence 1 No 2, StabiRatG	15 / 16	0,94
В	Enforcement mechanisms		4		There are no specific sanctions (valid for every bill), the Stability Council only monitors the enforcement but cannot sanction defections or impose corrective measures	1 / 4	0,2!
	Coverage Official budget: - shareholdings - debt claims by public authorities - granted loans - reserves Public enterprises Special funds Financial support for local authorities		1,75 0,75 1 1 1 0 0 0			0 / 1 0 / 1 1 / 1	0,44 0,75 0,00 0,00 1,00
	Flexibility Business cycle Economic shocks Other emergencies Compensational mechanism		0			1 / 4 0 / 1 1 / 1 0 / 1 0 / 1	0,2! 0,00 1,00 0,00 0,00
Е	Content Clear definitions		Borrowing: 2 (speficied in HGrG) Investments: 1 (vague definition in LHO Art. 13 (3) No 2 sentence 2)	Disturbance of the macroeconomic equilibrium: 0 (not specified)	Legal provisions are clearly defined	6 / 20 4 / 6	0,30
	Strict aim		0		1		0,0
	Strict rule		1 0			2 / 8	0,2
		•		•	Sum	24,75 / 48	

		Part o	of Rule		Total Points	Std. Points
	Basic rule	Regulations	Relaxations	Sanctions		
Description	BBR: balanced budget	Max. borrowing equal to the amount of expenditures for investments	Borrowing above investments-clause allowed in case of "extraordinary demands" and in order to respond to a "disturbance of the macroeconomic equilibrium"	A tenth of the Parliament's members, the government, the prime minister or one hundreth of all people eligible to vote can take the budget to the constitutional court; Stability Council monitors enforcement, if a budgetary emergency occurs, the Council sets up and monitors the financial restructuring programme		
	Constitution Art. 141, LHO Art. 18 (1)	Art. 18 (1)	Constitution Art. 141, LHO Art. 18 (1)	Constitution Art. 131; Stability Council: Federal constitution Art. 109a sentence 1 No 2, StabiRatG	16 / 16	1,0
3 Enforcement mechanisms				There are no specific sanctions (valid for every bill), the Stability Council only monitors the enforcement but cannot sanction defections or impose corrective measures	1 / 4	0,2
Coverage Official budget: - shareholdings - debt claims by public authorities - granted loans - reserves Public enterprises Special funds Financial support for local authorities		1,75 0,75 1 1 1 0 0 0			0 / 1 0 / 1 1 / 1	0,4 0,7 0,0 0,0 0,0 1,0
Plexibility Business cycle Economic shocks Other emergencies Compensational mechanism		0			2 / 4 0 / 1 1 / 1 1 / 1 0 / 1	0,5 0,0 1,0 1,0 0,0
Content Clear definitions	1	Borrowing: 2 (speficied in HGrG) Investments: 1 (vague definition in LHO Art. 13 (3) No 2 sentence 2)	equilibrium: 0 (not specified)	Legal provisions are clearly defined	6 / 20	0,3
		2	0) 2	4 / 6	

HE - from 2020 on¹

Cate	gories		Part o	of Rule		Total Points	Std. Points
		Basic rule	Regulations	Relaxations	Sanctions	+	
Desc	ription	BBR: balanced budget	"in principle" no borrowing, symmetric response to business cycle fluctuations	Borrowing allowed in case of natural catastrophes or	A tenth of the Parliament's members, the government, the prime minister or one hundreth of all people eligible to vote can take the budget to the constitutional court; Stability Council monitors enforcement, if a budgetary emergency occurs, the Council sets up and monitors the financial restructuring programme		
A I	Legal base	Constitution Art. 141	Constitution Art. 141	Constitution Art. 141, LHO Art. 18 (1)	Constitution Art. 131; Stability Council: Federal constitution Art. 109a sentence 1 No 2, StabiRatG	16 / 16	1,0
	Enforcement mechanisms	4	4	4	There are no specific sanctions (valid for every bill), the Stability Council only monitors the enforcement but cannot sanction defections or impose corrective measures		0,2
a F S	Coverage Official budget: - shareholdings - debt claims by public authorities - granted loans - reserves Public enterprises Special funds Financial support for		1,75 0,75 1 1 1 0 0 0			1,75 / 4 0,75 / 1 0 / 1 0 / 1 1 / 1	0,4 0,7 0,0 0,0 0,0
	ocal authorities Flexibility Business cycle Economic shocks Other emergencies Compensational mechanism		1 1	3		4 / 4 1 / 1 1 / 1 1 / 1 1 / 1	1,00 1,00 1,00 1,00 1,00
E (Content Clear definitions	1	Borrowing: 2 (speficied in HGrG) In principle: 2 (referring to business cycle fluctuations) Business cycle: 1 ("symmetric response" as vague measurement, LHO needed)	must be justified) Redemption plan: 2 (time span not specified)	Legal provisions are clearly defined		0,60
	Strict aim Strict rule	1	2 1 1	1	0	2 / 6	1,0 0,3 0,5

¹ Current LHO only valid until 31.12.2012

A Legal base Constitution Art. 65 (1) Constitution Art. 71 emitence 2, U/O Art. 18 (1) emitence 2, U/O Art. 18 (Categories			f Rule		Total Points	Std. Points
the amount of expenditures in order to respond to a disdurbance of the macroscopromotic to "natural living conditions" and individual and budget of the constitution Art. 65 (1) Constitution Art. 71 sentence 2, LHO Art. 18 (1) sentence 3, LHO Art. 19 sentence 1 to 2 stability candid configuration for the properties of the configuration for the configura		Basic rule	Regulations				
Sentence 2, LHO Art. 18 (1) Sentence 2, LHO Art. 18 (1) Sentence 1 No 2, Stability Council: Federal constitution Art. 109a sentence 1 No 2, Stability Council Federal constitution Art. 109a sentence 1 No 2, Stability Council constitution Art. 109a sentence 1 No 2, Stability Council constitution Art. 109a sentence 1 No 2, Stability Council constitution Art. 109a sentence 1 No 2, Stability Council constitution Art. 109a sentence 1 No 2, Stability Council constitution Art. 109a sentence 1 No 2, Stability Council constitution Art. 109a sentence 1 No 2, Stability Council constitution Art. 109a sentence 1 No 2, Stability Council constitution Art. 109a sentence 1 No 2, Stability Council constitution Art. 109a sentence 1 No 2, Stability Council constitution Art. 109a sentence 1 No 2, Stability Council Coun	Description	BBR: balanced budget	the amount of expenditures	investments-clause allowed in order to respond to a "disturbance of the macroeconomic equilibrium" or to a threat to "natural living	members or the government can take the budget to the constitutional court; Stability Council monitors enforcement, if a budgetary emergency occurs, the Council sets up and monitors the financial		
There are no specific sanctions (valid for every bill), the Stability Council only monitors the enforcement but cannot sanction (valid for every bill), the Stability Council only monitors the enforcement but cannot sanction defections or impose corrective measures 1,75	A Legal base	, ,	sentence 2, LHO Art. 18 (1)	sentence 2, LHO Art. 18 (1)	sentence 1 No 2, Stability Council: Federal constitution Art. 109a sentence 1 No 2, StabiRatG	16 / 16	1,00
Official budget: - shareholdings - debt claims by public authorities - granted loans - reserves - public enterprises - practic local authorities - practic local authoriti		4	4	4	There are no specific sanctions (valid for every bill), the Stability Council only monitors the enforcement but cannot sanction defections or	1 / 4	0,25
Description Flexibility Business cycle Economic shocks Compensational mechanism Clear definitions Clear definitions Clear definitions Investments: 1 (vague definition in LHO Art. 13 (3) No 2 sentence 2) Strict aim Strict rule Strict rule Strict rule Strict since	Official budget: - shareholdings - debt claims by public authorities - granted loans - reserves Public enterprises Special funds Financial support for		0,75 1 1 1 0 0 0			0,75 / 1 0 / 1 0 / 1	0,44 0,75 0,00 0,00 1,00
Clear definitions Borrowing: 2 (speficied in HGrG) Borrowing: 2 (speficied in HGrG) Disturbance of the macroeconomic equilibrium: 1 (not specified, but the disturbance and that borrowing will help to repel it must be defined by law) Investments: 1 (vague definition in LHO Art. 13 (3) No 2 sentence 2) Strict aim Strict rule Strict rule Strict aim Strict a	D Flexibility Business cycle Economic shocks Other emergencies Compensational			1 1		0 / 1 1 / 1 1 / 1	0,50 0,00 1,00 1,00 0,00
Strict aim 0 0 0 0 / 6 0,0 Strict rule 1 0 0 1 2 / 8 0,2 Sum 27,75 / 48	Content	1	Borrowing: 2 (speficied in HGrG) Investments: 1 (vague definition in LHO Art. 13 (3) No 2 sentence 2)	macroeconomic equilibrium: 1 (not specified, but the disturbance and that borrowing will help to repel it must be defined by law) Natural living conditions: 1 (not specified but explicitely related to nature)	defined		0,35
						5 / 6	0,83
Index score 0,5		1				2 / 8	0,00

			of Rule		Total Points	Std. Points
	Basic rule	Regulations	Relaxations	Sanctions		
Description	BBR: balanced budget	Max. borrowing equal to the amount of expenditures for investments	Borrowing above investments-clause allowed in order to respond to a "disturbance of the macroeconomic equilibrium"	A third of the Parliament's members or the government can take the budget to the constitutional court; Stability Council monitors enforcement, if a budgetary emergency occurs, the Council sets up and monitors the financial restructuring programme		
A Legal base	Constitution Art. 65 (2), LHO Art. 18 (1)	Constitution Art. 65 (2), LHO Art. 18 (1)	Constitution Art. 65 (2), LHO Art. 18 (1)	Constitution Art. 53 sentence 1 No 2, Stability Council: Federal constitution Art. 109a sentence 1 No 2, StabiRatG	16 / 16	1,00
B Enforcement mechanisms				There are no specific sanctions (valid for every bill), the Stability Council only monitors the enforcement but cannot sanction defections or impose corrective measures	1 / 4	0,25
C Coverage Official budget: - shareholdings - debt claims by public authorities - granted loans - reserves Public enterprises Special funds Financial support for		1,75 0,75 1 1 1 0 0 0 0			0 / 1 0 / 1 1 / 1	0,44 0,75 0,00 0,00 1,00
local authorities D Flexibility Business cycle Economic shocks Other emergencies Compensational mechanism		0 0			1 / 4 0 / 1 1 / 1 0 / 1 0 / 1	0,25 0,00 1,00 0,00 0,00
E Content Clear definitions		Borrowing: 2 (speficied in HGrG) Investments: 1 (vague definition in LHO Art. 13 (3) No 2 sentence 2)	Disturbance of the macroeconomic equilibrium: 1 (not specified, but the disturbance and that borrowing will help to repel it must be defined by law)	3 Legal provisions are clearly defined	7 / 20	0,35
		INU Z SCHLCHCC Z)				

MV - from 2020 on¹

Categories		Part	of Rule		Total Points	Std. Points
	Basic rule	Regulations	Relaxations	Sanctions		
Description	BBR: balanced budget	"in principle" no borrowing, symmetric adaption to business cycle fluctuations	Borrowing allowed in order to respond to natural catastrophes and extraordinary emergencies, simultaneously decide a redemption plan (adequat time span)	A third of the Parliament's members or the government can take the budget to the constitutional court; Stability Council monitors enforcement, if a budgetary emergency occurs, the Council sets up and monitors the financial restructuring programme		
A Legal base	Constitution Art. 65 (2)	Constitution Art. 65 (2)	Constitution Art. 65 (2)	Constitution Art. 53 sentence 1 No 2; Stability Council: Federal constitution Art. 109a sentence 1 No 2, StabiRatG	16 / 16	1,0
3 Enforcement mechanisms		-		There are no specific sanctions (valid for every bill), the Stability Council only monitors the enforcement but cannot sanction defections or impose corrective measures	1 / 4	0,2
C Coverage Official budget: - shareholdings - debt claims by public authorities - granted loans - reserves		1,75 0,75 1 1			1,75 / 4 0,75 / 1	0,4 0,7
Public enterprises Special funds Financial support for local authorities		0 0 1			0 / 1 0 / 1 1 / 1	0,0 0,0 1,0
D Flexibility Business cycle Economic shocks Other emergencies Compensational mechanism		1			4 / 4 1 / 1 1 / 1 1 / 1 1 / 1	1,0 1,0 1,0 1,0 1,0
E Content Clear definitions	1	Borrowing: 2 (speficied in HGrG)	Natural catastrophe: 2 (not specified in detail but general understanding, use must be justified)	Legal provisions are clearly defined	11 / 20	0,5
		In principle: 2 (referring to business cycle fluctuations) Business cycle: 1 ("symmetric response" as vague measurement, LHO needed)	Extraordinary emergencies: 1 (not specified, but use must be justified) Redemption plan: 2 (time span not specified)			
Strict aim Strict rule	1	2 1 1	. 1	0	2 / 6 4 / 8	1,0 0,3 0,5
				Sum	33,75 / 48	•

 $^{^{\}mbox{\tiny 1}}$ No appropriate LHO decided, yet.

Catego	ries		Part o	of Rule		Total Points	Std. Points
_		Basic rule	Regulations	Relaxations	Sanctions		
Descrip	otion		Max. borrowing equal to the amount of expenditures for investments	Borrowing above investments-clause allowed in order to respond to a "disturbance of the macroeconomic equilibrium"	A third of the Parliament's members or the government can take the budget to the constitutional court; Stability Council monitors enforcement, if a budgetary emergency occurs, the Council sets up and monitors the financial restructuring programme		
A Le		Constitution Art. 83 sentence 2, LHO Art. 18 (1)	Constitution Art. 83 sentence 2, LHO Art. 18 (1)	LHO Art. 18 (1) sentence 2	Constitution Art. 75 sentence 1 No 3, Stability Council: Federal constitution Art. 109a sentence 1 No 2, StabiRatG	15 / 16	0,94
	forcement echanisms				There are no specific sanctions (valid for every bill), the Stability Council only monitors the enforcement but cannot sanction defections or impose corrective measures	1 / 4	0,29
Off - s - c aut - g - r Put Spe Fin	verage icial budget: shareholdings debt claims by public thorities granted loans reserves blic enterprises ecial funds ancial support for		1,75 0,75 1 1 1 0 0 0			0 / 1 0 / 1 0 / 1 1 / 1	0,44 0,75 0,00 0,00 1,00
D Fle Bus Eco Oth Cor	al authorities exibility siness cycle onomic shocks her emergencies mpensational ichanism		0			1 / 4 0 / 1 1 / 1 0 / 1 0 / 1	0,25 0,00 1,00 0,00 0,00
E Co	ntent ear definitions		Borrowing: 2 (speficied in HGrG) Investments: 1 (vague definition in LHO Art. 13 (3) No 2 sentence 2)	Disturbance of the macroeconomic equilibrium: 1 (not specified, but the disturbance and that borrowing will help to repel it must be defined by law)	Legal provisions are clearly defined		0,3!
	ict aim ict rule	1	2 0 0	0		0 / 6 2 / 8	0,83 0,00 0,25
					Sum	25,75 / 48	

Cate	gories		Part o	of Rule		Total Points	Std. Points
	_	Basic rule	Regulations	Relaxations	Sanctions		
Desc	cription	-	Max. borrowing equal to the amount of expenditures for investments	Borrowing above investments-clause allowed in order to respond to a "disturbance of the macroeconomic equilibrium"	The Parliament, a parliamentary group ("Fraktion") or the government can take the budget to the constitutional court; Stability Council monitors enforcement, if a budgetary emergency occurs, the Council sets up and monitors the financial restructuring programme		
A	Legal base		Constitution Art. 117 sentence 2, LHO Art. 18 (1)	, , , , , ,	constitution Art. 109a sentence 1 No 2, StabiRatG	16 / 16	1,00
	Enforcement mechanisms				There are no specific sanctions (valid for every bill), the Stability Council only monitors the enforcement but cannot sanction defections or impose corrective measures		0,2!
	Coverage Official budget: - shareholdings - debt claims by public authorities - granted loans - reserves Public enterprises Special funds Financial support for		1,75 0,75 1 1 1 0 0 0			0 / 1 0 / 1 1 / 1	0,44 0,75 0,00 0,00 1,00
D	local authorities Flexibility Business cycle Economic shocks Other emergencies Compensational mechanism		0			1 / 4 0 / 1 1 / 1 0 / 1 0 / 1	0,2! 0,00 1,00 0,00 0,00
E	Content Clear definitions	1	Borrowing: 2 (speficied in HGrG) Investments: 1 (vague definition in LHO Art. 13 (3) No 2 sentence 2)	Disturbance of the macroeconomic equilibrium: 1 (not specified, but the disturbance and that borrowing will help to repel it must be defined by law)	3 Legal provisions are clearly defined	7 / 20	0,3:
	Strict aim Strict rule	1	2 0 0	0	0 1	0 / 6 2 / 8	0,83 0,00 0,25
					Sum	26,75 / 48	

RP - from 2020 on¹

				of Rule		Total Points	Std. Points
		Basic rule	Regulations	Relaxations	Sanctions	Ī	
Descr	iption	BBR: balanced budget	"in principle" no borrowing (considering also borrowing by state owned or state controlled bodies), symmetric adaption to business cycle fluctuations	catastrophes, extraordinary emergencies, max. four-years-long adaptation to legal changes targeting the income or expenditure side of the budget, simultaneously decide a redemption plan	The Parliament, a parliamentary group ("Fraktion") or the government can take the budget to the constitutional court; Stability Council monitors enforcement, if a budgetary emergency occurs, the Council sets up and monitors the financial restructuring programme		
A L	egal base	Constitution Art. 117	Constitution Art. 117	Constitution Art. 117	Constitution Art. 130 (1); Stability Council: Federal constitution Art. 109a sentence 1 No 2, StabiRatG	16 / 16	1,00
	inforcement nechanisms				There are no specific sanctions (valid for every bill), the Stability Council only monitors the enforcement but cannot sanction defections or impose corrective measures	1 / 4	0,2!
C - a -	overage Official budget: - shareholdings - debt claims by public uthorities - granted loans - reserves ublic enterprises		3,75 0,75 1 1 1 0			3,75 / 4 0,75 / 1	0,9 4 0,7
S F	pecial funds inancial support for ocal authorities		1 1			1 / 1 1 1 / 1	1,0
B C C	lexibility usiness cycle conomic shocks bither emergencies compensational nechanism		1 1			4 / 4 1 / 1 1 / 1 1 / 1 1 / 1	1,00 1,00 1,00 1,00 1,00
E C	icinismi icontent ilear definitions		Borrowing: 2 (structural deficit, LHO will define calculation precisely) In principle: 2 (referring to business cycle fluctuations) Business cycle: 1 ("symmetric adaption" as vague measurement, LHO needed)	Natural catastrophe: 2 (not specified in detail but general understanding, use must be justified) Extraordinary emergencies:	3 Legal provisions are clearly defined	14 / 20	0,76
S	trict aim		2 1 1	1	0	6 / 6 2 / 6 6 / 8	1,0 0,3 0,7
S	trict rule					38,75 / 48	0//

¹ No appropriate LHO decided, yet.

mechanisms C C Coverage Official budget: - shareholdings - debt claims by public authorities - granted loans - reserves Public enterprises Special funds Financial support for local authorities D Flexibility Business cycle Economic shocks Compensational mechanism C Clear definitions E Content C Clear definitions C Content C Clear definitions Investments: 2 (vague definition in LHO Art. 13 (3) My No 2 sentence 2, specified definition for construction for construction for construction will help to repeil that the borrowing will make be to interpretation of "exceptional situations: 0 for calculations in VV No 15.2 concerning LHO Art. 44) Structural deficit: 2 (clear definition in VV Konstrilif() Exceeded limit: 2 (mumerical deficit: 2 (clear definition in VV Konstrilif() Exceptional situations: 0 for exceptional) Exceptional situations: 0 for exceptional situations: 0 for exceptional situations: 0 for exceptional) Exceptional situations: 0 for exceptional situations: 0 for exceptional)	Cate	egories			of Rule		Total Points	Std. Points
the amount of expenditures in cardior to propend to a full control of the first investments. In cardior to respond to a full control of the support of of								
Imits for structural deficit until 2019 A Legal base Constitution Art. 105 (1) sentence 2, KonsHilfG Art. 4 2, VV KonsHilfG Art. 4 B Enforcement mechanisms B Enforcement mechanisms C C Coverage Official budget: - shareholdings - dept claims by public agreement Special funds - reserves - public enterprises - special funds - granted lons - reserves - public enterprises - Special funds - granted lons - reserves - public enterprises - Special funds - granted lons - reserves - public enterprises - Special funds - granted lons - reserves - public enterprises - Special funds - granted lons - reserves - public enterprises - Special funds - granted lons - reserves - public enterprises - Special funds - granted lons - reserves - public enterprises - Special funds - granted lons - reserves - public enterprises - Special funds - granted lons - reserves - public enterprises - Special funds - granted lons - reserves - public enterprises - Special funds - granted lons - reserves - public enterprises - Special funds - granted lons - reserves - public enterprises - Special funds - granted lons - reserves - public enterprises - Special funds - granted lons - reserves - public enterprises - Special funds - granted lons - reserves - public enterprises - Special funds - granted lons - reserves - public enterprises - Special funds - granted lons - reserves - public enterprises - Special funds - granted lons - reserves - public enterprises - Special funds - granted lons - granted lo	Des	cription	BBR: balanced budget	the amount of expenditures	investments-clause allowed in order to respond to a "disturbance of the macroeconomic equilibrium" or to "extraordinary demands", redemption plan in case of	members or the government can take the budget to the constitutional court; Stability Council monitors enforcement, if a budgetary emergency occurs, the Council sets up and monitors the financial		
Sentence 2, Norshill of Art. 2, W Konshill G Art.			limits for structural deficit		limits allowed in case of exceptional situations (must be approved by the	if Stability Council		
The content of the co	Α	Legal base	sentence 2, KonsHilfG Art. 2, VV KonsHilfG Art. 4	LHO Art. 18 (1), KonsHilfG Art. 2, VV KonsHilfG	LHO Art. 18 (1), VV KonsHilfG Art. 6	sentence 1 No 2; Stability Council: Federal constitution Art. 109a sentence 1 No 2, StabiRatG, VV KonsHilfG	12 / 16	0,7!
Official budget: - shareholdings - debt claims by public authorities - granted loans - reserves Public enterprises Special funds Financial support for local authorities - granted loans - reserves Public enterprises Special funds Financial support for local authorities D Hexibility Business cycle Economic shocks Other emergencies Compensational mechanism enchanism Clear definitions E Content Clear definitions Clear definition in LHO Art. 1.3 (3) Investments: 2 (vague definition in LHO Art. 1.3 (3) Investments: 2 (vague definition in LHO Art. 1.3 (3) Investments: 2 (vague definition in LHO Art. 1.3 (3) Investments: 2 (vague definition in LHO Art. 1.3 (3) Investments: 2 (vague definition in LHO Art. 1.3 (3) Investments: 2 (vague definition in LHO Art. 1.3 (3) Investments: 2 (vague definition in LHO Art. 1.3 (3) Investments: 2 (vague definition in LHO Art. 1.3 (3) Investments: 2 (vague definition in LHO Art. 1.3 (3) Investments: 2 (vague definition in LHO Art. 1.3 (3) Investments: 2 (vague definition in LHO Art. 1.3 (3) Investments: 2 (vague definition in LHO Art. 1.3 (3) Investments: 2 (vague definition in LHO Art. 1.3 (3) Investments: 2 (vague definition in LHO Art. 1.3 (3) Investments: 2 (vague definition in LHO Art. 1.3 (3) Investments: 2 (vague definition in LHO Art. 1.3 (3) Investments: 2 (vague definition in LHO Art. 1.3 (3) Investments: 2 (vague definition in LHO Art. 1.3 (3) Investments: 2 (vague definition in LHO Art. 1.3 (3) Investments: 2 (vague definition in LHO Art. 1.3 (3) Investments: 2 (vague definition in LHO Art. 1.3 (3) Investments: 2 (vague definition in LHO Art. 1.3 (3) Investments: 2 (vague definition in LHO Art. 1.3 (3) Investments: 2 (vague definition in LHO Art. 1.3 (3) Investments: 2 (vague definition in LHO Art. 1.3 (3) Investments: 2 (vague definition in LHO Art. 1.3 (3) Investments: 2 (vague definition in LHO Art. 3.3 (3) Investments: 2 (vague definition in LHO Art. 3.3 (3) Investments: 2 (vague definition in LHO Art. 3.3 (3) Investments: 2 (vague definition in LHO Art. 3.3 (3) Inve	В					implicit obligation for corrective measures		0,7!
Public enterprises Special funds Financial support for local authorities D Flexibility Business cycle Economic shocks Other emergencies Compensational mechanism E Content Clear definitions Clear definitions Investments: 2 (speficied in HGrG) Investments: 2 (vague definition in LHO Art. 13 (3) No 2 sentence 2, specified, but the disturbance and that borrowing will help to repel it must be defined by law) Extraordinary demands: 1 clost specified, but the disturbance and that borrowing will help to repel it must be defined by law) Extraordinary demands: 1 clost specified, but the disturbance and that borrowing will help to repel it must be defined by law) Extraordinary demands: 1 clost specified, but the disturbance and that borrowing will help to repel it must be defined by law) Extraordinary demands: 1 clost specified, but the disturbance and that borrowing will help to repel it must be defined by law) Extraordinary demands: 1 clost specified, but the disturbance and that borrowing will help to repel it must be defined by law) Extraordinary demands: 1 clost specified, but the disturbance and that borrowing will help to repel it must be defined by law) Exceptional situations*) of "exceptional situations*) of "exceptional situations") of "exceptional situations of "exceptional situations of "exceptional situations") (not specified, Stability Council is free to determine a situation as exceptionnal)	С	Official budget: - shareholdings - debt claims by public authorities - granted loans		0,75 1 1 1				0,4 4 0,7
Business cycle Economic shocks Other emergencies Compensational mechanism E Content Clear definitions Investments: 2 (speficied in HGrG) Investments: 2 (vague definition in LHO Art. 13 (3) No 2 sentence 2, specified definition for constructions of buildings in Appendix 7 VV No 15.2 concerning LHO Art. 44) Structural deficit: 2 (clear definition in WV KonsHilfG) Structural deficit: 2 (clear definition in WV KonsHilfG) Exceeded limit: 2 (unumerical definition, but: vulnerable to interpretation of "exceptional situations") Exceeded limit: 2 (unumerical definition, but: vulnerable to interpretation of "exceptional situations") Exceeded limit: 2 (unumerical definition, but: vulnerable to interpretation of "exceptional situations") Exceeded limit: 2 (unumerical definition, but: vulnerable to interpretation of "exceptional situations") Exceeded limit: 2 (unumerical definition, but: vulnerable to interpretation of "exceptional situations") Exceptional situations: 0 (not specified, but amount of debt that must be pack) Exceptional situations: 0 (not specified, Stability Council is free to determine a situation as exceptionnal)		Public enterprises Special funds Financial support for local authorities		0 0 1			0 / 1 1 / 1	0,00 0,00 1,00
Clear definitions Borrowing: 2 (speficied in HGrG) Borrowing: 2 (speficied in HGrG) Investments: 2 (vague definition in LHO Art. 13 (3) No 2 sentence 2, specified, definition for constructions of buildings in Appendix 7 VV No 15.2 concerning LHO Art. 44) Structural deficit: 2 (clear definition and method for calculation in VV KonsHilfG) Extractions and that borrowing will help to repel it must be defined by law) Extractions and that borrowing will help to repel it must be defined by law) Extractions and that borrowing will help to repel it must be defined by law) Extractions and that borrowing will help to repel it must be defined by law) Extractional situations: 0 (incl. specified, but amount of debt that must be payed back) Exceptional situations: 0 (incl. specified, Stability Council is free to determine a situation as exceptionnal)	D	Business cycle Economic shocks Other emergencies Compensational			1 1		0 / 1 1 / 1 1 / 1	0,75 0,00 1,00 1,00
definition in LHO Art. 13 (3) No 2 sentence 2, specified definition for constructions of buildings in Appendix 7 VV No 15.2 concerning LHO Art. 44) Structural deficit: 2 (clear definition and method for calculation in VV KonsHilfG) Exceptional situations: 0 (not specified, but the disturbance and that borrowing will help to repel it must be defined by law) Redemption plan: 1 (time span not specified, but amount of debt that must be payed back) Exceptional situations: 0 (not specified, Stability Council is free to determine a situation as exceptionnal)	E		2	Borrowing: 2 (speficied in	Disturbance of the macroeconomic equilibrium: 1 (not specified, but the disturbance and that borrowing will help to repel	Legal provisions are clearly	17 / 20	0,8
definition and method for calculation in VV KonsHilfG) span not specified, but amount of debt that must be payed back) Exceptional situations: 0 (not specified, Stability Council is free to determine a situation as exceptionnal) 2 1 2 5 / 6				definition in LHO Art. 13 (3) No 2 sentence 2, specified definition for constructions of buildings in Appendix 7 VV No 15.2 concerning LHO	(not specified, but the disturbance and that borrowing will help to repel	(numerical definition, but: vulnerable to interpretation		
2 1 2 5 / 6				definition and method for	span not specified, but amount of debt that must be payed back) Exceptional situations: 0 (not specified, Stability			
		Strict aim		2	1 1	2	4 / 6	0,83 0,65
Strict rule 2 2 2 2 8 / 8 Sum 36,75 / 48		Strict rule	2	2	2	2		1,00

SL - from 2020 on

	on Art. 105 (1)	Regulations Max. borrowing equal to the amount of expenditures for investments Constitution Art. 108 (2), LHO Art. 18 (1)	in order to respond to a "disturbance of the macroeconomic equilibrium" or to "extraordinary demands", redemption plan in case of "extraordinary demands" Constitution Art. 108 (2), LHO Art. 18 (1)	Sanctions A third of the Parliament's members or the government can take the budget to the constitutional court; Stability Council monitors enforcement, if a budgetary emergency occurs, the Council sets up and monitors the financial restructuring programme Constitution Art. 97 sentence 1 No 2; Stability Council: Federal constitution Art. 109a sentence 1 No 2, StabiRatG There are no specific sanctions (valid for every bill), the Stability Council	16 / 16	1,00
A Legal base Constitution sentence 2 B Enforcement mechanisms C Coverage Official budget: - shareholdings	on Art. 105 (1)	the amount of expenditures for investments Constitution Art. 108 (2), LHO Art. 18 (1)	investments-clause allowed in order to respond to a "disturbance of the macroeconomic equilibrium" or to "extraordinary demands", redemption plan in case of "extraordinary demands" Constitution Art. 108 (2), LHO Art. 18 (1)	members or the government can take the budget to the constitutional court; Stability Council monitors enforcement, if a budgetary emergency occurs, the Council sets up and monitors the financial restructuring programme Constitution Art. 97 sentence 1 No 2; Stability Council: Federal constitution Art. 109a sentence 1 No 2, StabiRatG There are no specific sanctions (valid for every	16 / 16	
B Enforcement mechanisms C Coverage Official budget: - shareholdings	2	LHO Art. 18 (1)	LHO Art. 18 (1)	sentence 1 No 2; Stability Council: Federal constitution Art. 109a sentence 1 No 2, StabiRatG There are no specific sanctions (valid for every		
C Coverage Official budget: - shareholdings				sanctions (valid for every	1 / 4	0,25
Official budget: - shareholdings				only monitors the enforcement but cannot sanction defections or impose corrective measures		
authorities - granted loans - reserves Public enterprises Special funds Financial support for		1,75 0,75 1 1 1 0 0 0			1,75 / 4 0,75 / 1 0 / 1 0 / 1 1 / 1	0,44 0,75 0,00 0,00 1,00
local authorities D Flexibility Business cycle Economic shocks Other emergencies Compensational mechanism		0			3 / 4 0 / 1 1 / 1 1 / 1 1 / 1	0,75 0,00 1,00 1,00 1,00
E Content Clear definitions	1	Borrowing: 2 (speficied in HGrG) Investments: 2 (vague definition in LHO Art. 13 (3) No 2 sentence 2, specified definition for constructions of buildings in Appendix 7 VV No 15.2 concerning LHO Art. 44)	Disturbance of the macroeconomic equilibrium: 1 (not specified, but the disturbance and that borrowing will help to repel it must be defined by law) Extraordinary demands: 1	3 Legal provisions are clearly defined	8 / 20	0,40
Strict aim Strict rule	1	2 0 0		2 0 1 Sum	5 / 6 0 / 6 3 / 8 29,75 / 48	0,83 0,00 0,38

			of Rule		Total Points	Std. Points
		Regulations	Relaxations	Sanctions		
Description		Max. borrowing equal to the amount of expenditures for investments	Borrowing above investments-clause allowed in order to respond to a "disturbance of the macroeconomic equilibrium"	A fourth of the Parliament's members or the government can take the budget to the constitutional court; Stability Council monitors enforcement, if a budgetary emergency occurs, the Council sets up and monitors the financial restructuring programme		
	market debt stock	stock of 2008; Higher debt stock allowed if tax income	Higher debt stock allowed in case of natural catastrophes or similar severe emergencies (their impact is of supra-regional character); simulatneously decide a redemption plan for max. 5 years			
	(1) sentence 2, LHO Art. 18	BBR: constitution Art. 95 sentence 2, LHO Art. 18; DR: LHO Art. 18	BBR: constitution Art. 95 sentence 2, LHO Art. 18; DR: LHO Art. 18	Constitution Art. 81 (1) No 2; Stability Council: Federal constitution Art. 109a sentence 1 No 2, StabiRatG		0,8
B Enforcement mechanisms			3	There are no specific sanctions (valid for every bill), the Stability Council only monitors the enforcement but cannot sanction defections or impose corrective measures	1 / 4	0,2
Official budget: - shareholdings - debt claims by public authorities - granted loans - reserves Public enterprises Special funds Financial support for		1,75 0,75 1 1 1 0 0 0			0 / 1 0 / 1 1 / 1	0,4 0,7 0,0 0,0 0,0 1,0
local authorities Flexibility Business cycle Economic shocks Other emergencies Compensational mechanism		1 1			4 / 4 1 / 1 1 / 1 1 / 1 1 / 1	1,0 1,0 1,0 1,0 1,0
E Content Clear definitions		6 Borrowing: 2 (speficied in HGrG) Investments: 1 (vague	Disturbance of the macroeconomic equilibrium: 1 (not specified, but the disturbance and that borrowing will help to repel it must be defined by law) Natural catastrophe: 2 (not	3 Legal provisions are clearly defined	17 / 20	0,8
		definition in LHO Art. 13 (3) No 2 sentence 2) Debt stock in 2008: 2 (definititve numerical value)	specified in detail but general understanding, use must be justified) Similar severe emergencies: 2 ("supranational character", use must be justified)			
0		Tax income decrease: 2 (clear numerical definition) 2 2	Redemption plan: 2			1,0 0,6
Strict aim						
Strict aim Strict rule	2	2			,	0,8

Categories	B		of Rule		Total Points	Std. Points
	Basic rule	Regulations	Relaxations	Sanctions		
Description	BBR: balanced budget	Borrowing allowed in order to respond to business cycle fluctuations, simultaneously decide about redemption plan (adequate time span, latest beginning four years after borrowing)	Higher borrowing allowed in case of natural catastrophes or extraordinary emergencies, simultaneously decide about redemption plan (adequate time span, latest beginning four years after borrowing)	A fourth of the Parliament's members or the government can take the budget to the constitutional court; Stability Council monitors enforcement, if a budgetary emergency occurs, the Council sets up and monitors the financial restructuring programme		
	BBR (KonsHilfG): numerical limits for structural deficit until 2019 DR: debt must decrease	along chain Define yearly (at best constant) amounts for redemption, spend additional tax income on redemption	Structural deficit above limits allowed in case of exceptional situations (must be approved by the Stability Council)	Financial Support is cut off if Stability Council considers limits exceeded		
A Legal base	BBR: constitution Art. 93 (1) sentence 2, LHO Art. 18 (1), KonsHilfG Art. 2, VV KonsHilfG Art. 4; DR: LHO Art. 18 (4)	KonsHilfG; DR: LHO Art. 18 (4)	BBR: LHO Art. 18, KonsHilfG Art. 2, VV KonsHilfG; DR: LHO Art. 18 (4)	Constitution Art. 75 sentence 1 No 3; Stability Council: Federal constitution Art. 109a sentence 1 No 2, StabiRatG, VV KonsHilfG Art. 8	12 / 16	0,7
B Enforcement mechanisms				Financial support is cut off, implicit obligation for corrective measures	3 / 4	0,7!
C Coverage Official budget: - shareholdings - debt claims by public authorities - granted loans - reserves		1,75 0,75 1 1 1			1,75 / 4 0,75 / 1	0,4 4 0,7
Public enterprises Special funds Financial support for local authorities		0 0 1			0 / 1 0 / 1 1 / 1	0,00 0,00 1,00
D Flexibility Business cycle Economic shocks Other emergencies Compensational mechanism		1 1			4 / 4 1 / 1 1 / 1 1 / 1 1 / 1	1,00 1,00 1,00 1,00 1,00
E Content Clear definitions	2	6 Borrowing: 2 (structural deficit)	Natural catastrophe: 2 (not specified in detail but general understanding, use must be justified)	-	18 / 20	0,90
		Business cycle: 2 (measurement not specified, but use must be justified, LHO needed)	Extraordinary emergencies: 1 (not specified, but use must be justified)	Exceeded limit: 2 (numerical definition, but: vulnerable to interpretation of "exceptional situations")		
		Redemption plan: 2 (time span not specified)	Redemption plan: 2 (time span not specified)			
		Structural deficit: 2 (clear definition and method for calculation in VV KonsHilfG) Debt stock decrease: 2 (use	Exceptional situations: 0 (not specified, Stability Council is free to determine a situation as exceptionnal)			
		of additional tax income specified)	1	2	5 / 6 5 / 6	0,8:
Strict aim				· 1	J / U	0,0.
Strict aim Strict rule	2			2		1,00

ST - from 2020 on

		Part	of Rule		Total Points	Std. Points
	Basic rule	Regulations	Relaxations	Sanctions	1	
Description	BBR: balanced budget	Borrowing allowed in order to respond to business cycle fluctuations, simultaneously decide about redemption plan (adequate time span, latest beginning four years after borrowing)	Higher borrowing allowed in case of natural catastrophes or			
	DR: debt must decrease	Define yearly (at best constant) amounts for redemption, spend additional tax income on redemption				
A Legal base	BBR: constitution Art. 93 (1) sentence 2, LHO Art. 18 (1); DR: LHO Art. 18 (4)	Art. 18 (4)	BBR: LHO Art. 18; DR: LHO Art. 18 (4)	sentence 1 No 3; Stability Council: Federal constitution Art. 109a sentence 1 No 2, StabiRatG	13 / 16	0,8
B Enforcement mechanisms				There are no specific sanctions (valid for every bill), the Stability Council only monitors the enforcement but cannot sanction defections or impose corrective measures	1 / 4	0,2
C Coverage Official budget: - shareholdings - debt claims by public authorities - granted loans - reserves Public enterprises Special funds Financial support for		1,75 0,75 1 1 1 0 0 0			1,75 / 4 0,75 / 1 0 / 1 0 / 1 1 / 1	0,4 0,7 0,0 0,0 1,0
local authorities D Flexibility Business cycle Economic shocks Other emergencies Compensational		1 1	1 1 1 1		4 / 4 1 / 1 1 / 1 1 / 1 1 / 1	1,0 1,0 1,0 1,0 1,0
mechanism E Content Clear definitions	2	Business cycle: 2 (measurement not specified, but use must be justified, LHO needed) Redemption plan: 2 (time span not specified) Debt stock decrease: 2 (use of additional tax income specified)	Natural catastrophe: 2 (not specified in detail but general understanding, use must be justified) Extraordinary emergencies: 1 (not specified, but use must be justified) Redemption plan: 2 (time span not specified)		15 / 20	0,7
Strict aim	2	2	1		6 / 6 3 / 6 6 / 8	1,0 0,5 0,7

Cate	gories		Part o	of Rule		Total Points	Std. Points
		Basic rule	Regulations	Relaxations	Sanctions		
Desc	cription	BBR: balanced budget	Borrowing allowed in order to respond to business cycle fluctuations	Higher borrowing allowed in case of natural catastrophes or extraordinary emergencies (two-thirds majority), simultaneously decide redemption plan (adequate time span)	A third of the Parliament's members, two parliamentary groups or the government can take the budget to the constitutional court; Stability Council monitors enforcement, if a budgetary emergency occurs, the Council sets up and monitors the financial restructuring programme, Financial Support is cut off if Stability Council considers limits exceeded		
		BBR (KonsHilfG): numerical limits for structural deficit until 2019	Decrease structural deficit along chain	Structural deficit above limits allowed in case of exceptional situations (must be approved by the Stability Council)			
	Legal base	Constitution Art. 53 (1), KonsHilfG Art. 2, VV KonsHilfG Art. 4	Constitution Art. 53 (2), KonsHilfG Art. 2, VV KonsHilfG	Constitution Art. 53 (3) and (5), VV KonsHilfG Art. 6	2, Stability Council: Federal constitution Art. 109a sentence 1 No 2, StabiRatG, VV KonsHilfG Art. 8		0,8
	Enforcement mechanisms				Financial support is cut off, implicit obligation for corrective measures	3 / 4	0,7
	Coverage Official budget: - shareholdings - debt claims by public authorities - granted loans - reserves Public enterprises Special funds Financial support for local authorities		1,75 0,75 1 1 1 0 0 0			0 / 1 0 / 1 1 / 1	0,4 0,7 0,0 0,0 0,0
D	Flexibility Business cycle Economic shocks Other emergencies Compensational		1			4 / 4 1 / 1 1 / 1 1 / 1 1 / 1	1,0 1,0 1,0 1,0 1,0
E	mechanism Content Clear definitions	2	Borrowing: 2 (structural deficit) Business cycle: 1 (measurement not specified, but use must be justified, LHO needed) Structural deficit: 2 (clear definition and method for calculation in VV KonsHilfG)	Natural catastrophe: 2 (not specified in detail but general understanding, use must be justified)		17 / 20	0,8
	Strict aim Strict rule	2	2 2 2	(not specified, Stability Council is free to determine a situation as exceptionnal)	2	5 / 6 4 / 6 8 / 8	0,8 0,6 1,0
	Strict rule	2				0 / 0	1,0

SH - from 2020 on

		rait	of Rule		Total Points	Std. Points
ŀ	Basic rule	Regulations	Relaxations	Sanctions		
Description	BBR: balanced budget	Borrowing allowed in order to respond to business cycle fluctuations	Higher borrowing allowed in case of natural catastrophes or extraordinary emergencies (two-thirds majority), simultaneously decide redemption plan (adequate time span)	A third of the Parliament's members, two parliamentary groups or the government can take the budget to the constitutional court; Stability Council monitors enforcement, if a budgetary emergency occurs, the Council sets up and monitors the financial restructuring programme, Financial Support is cut off if Stability Council considers limits exceeded		
A Legal base	Constitution Art. 53 (1)	Constitution Art. 53 (2)	Constitution Art. 53 (3) and (5)	2, Stability Council: Federal constitution Art. 109a sentence 1 No 2, StabiRatG		1,0
B Enforcement mechanisms	4	4	4	There are no specific sanctions (valid for every bill), the Stability Council only monitors the enforcement but cannot sanction defections or impose corrective measures	1 / 4	0,2
C Coverage Official budget: - shareholdings - debt claims by public authorities - granted loans - reserves Public enterprises Special funds Financial support for		1,75 0,75 1 1 1 0 0 0 0			0 / 1 0 / 1 1 / 1	0,4 0,7 0,0 0,0 0,0 1,0
local authorities D Flexibility Business cycle Economic shocks Other emergencies Compensational mechanism		1 1			4 / 4 1 / 1 1 / 1 1 / 1 1 / 1	1,00 1,00 1,00 1,00 1,00
E Content Clear definitions	1	Borrowing: 2 (structural deficit) Business cycle: 2 (measurement specified, use must be justified)	Natural catastrophe: 2 (not specified in detail but general understanding, use must be justified) Extraordinary emergencies: 1 (not specified, but two-thirds majority must define it) Redemption plan: 2 (time span not specified, deficits in control account to be adjusted "with respect to the business cycle")	-	13 / 20	0,6
		2	2	2	6 / 6	1,00

(1) sentence 3, IHO Art. 18 (1), Rit constitution Art. 98 (3) Sability Council Federal constitution Art. 109 sentence 1 No. 2 Stabilistand, VV KonsHiff Art. 8 Art. 9	Categories		Part o	of Rule		Total Points	Std. Points
Description SSF: balanced budget Sorrowing allowed if total income is less than the everage of the last three everage of three everage of the last three everage of three everage of the last three everage of three evera	-	Basic rule	Regulations	Relaxations	Sanctions		
Description	Description		income is less than the average of the last three years, simultaneously decide redemtpion plan (5 years)	case of natural catastrophes or extraordinary emergencies, simultaneously decide	members, a parliamentary group or the government can take the budget to the constitutional court; Stability Council monitors enforcement, if a budgetary emergency occurs, the Council sets up and monitors the financial		
BBR: constitution Art. 98							
(1) sentence 3, IHO Art. 18 (1), ER: constitution Art. 98 (3) B Enforcement mechanisms B Enforcement mechanisms B Enforcement mechanisms C C Coverage Official budget:		DDD		1110 1 1 10 (0) 1 (0)	0 111 11 11 10 (1) 11	12 / 12	
mechanisms	A Legal base	(1) sentence 3, LHO Art. 18 (1), ER: constitution Art. 98 (3)			4; Stability Council: Federal constitution Art. 109a sentence 1 No 2, StabiRatG, VV KonsHilfG	13 / 16	0,8
Official budget: - shareholdings - debt claims by public authorities - granted loans - reserves O O O O O O O O O					sanctions (valid for every bill), the Stability Council only monitors the enforcement but cannot sanction defections or	1 / 4	0,2
- shareholdings - debt claims by public authorities - granted loans - reserves Public enterprises Special funds Financial support for local authorities - local author	_						0,4
Business cycle Economic shocks Other emergencies Compensational mechanism E Content Clear definitions Total income: 2 (definitive numerical value) Total income: 2 (time span not specified) Redemption plan: 2 (time span not specified) Expenditures for personnel: 2 (numerical value) Strict aim Strict rule Strict rule Ti / 1 1 / 1 1 / 1 1 / 1 1 / 1 1 / 1 1 / 1 1 / 1 1 / 1 1 / 1 1 / 1 1 / 1 1 / 1 1 / 1 1 / 1 1 / 1 1 / 1 1 / 1 1 / 1 1 / 1 1 / 1 1 / 1 1 / 1 1 / 1 1 / 1 1 / 1 1 / 1 1 / 1 1 / 1 1 / 1 1 / 1 1 / 1 1 / 1 1 / 1 1 / 1 1 / 1 1 / 1 1 / 1 1 / 1 1 / 1 1 / 1 1 / 1 1 / 1 1 / 1 1 / 1 1 / 1 1 / 1 1 / 1 1 / 1 1 / 1 1 / 1 1 / 1 1 / 1 1 / 1 1 / 1 1 / 1 1 / 1 1 / 1 1 / 1 1 / 1 1 / 1 1 / 1 1 / 1 1 / 1 1 / 1 1 / 1 1 / 1 1 / 1 1 / 1 1 / 1 1 / 1 1 / 1 1 / 1 1 / 1 1 / 1 1 / 1 1 / 1 1 / 1 1 / 1 1 / 1 1 / 1 1 / 1 1 / 1 1 / 1 1 / 1 1 / 1 1 / 1 1 / 1 1 / 1 1 / 1 1 / 1 1 / 1 1 / 1 1 / 1 1 / 1 1 / 1 1 / 1 1 / 1 1 / 1 1 / 1 1 / 1 1 / 1 1 / 1 1 / 1 1 / 1 1 / 1 1 / 1 1 / 1 1 / 1 1 / 1 1 / 1 1 / 1 1 / 1 1 / 1 1 / 1 1 / 1 1 / 1 1 / 1 1 / 1 1 / 1 1 / 1 1 / 1 1 / 1 1 / 1 1 / 1 1 / 1 1 / 1 1 / 1 1 / 1 1 / 1 1 / 1 1 / 1 1 / 1 1 / 1 1 / 1 1 / 1 1 / 1 1 / 1 1 / 1 1 / 1 1 / 1 1 / 1 1 / 1 1 / 1 1 / 1 1 / 1 1 / 1 1 / 1 1 / 1 1 / 1 1 / 1 1 / 1 1 / 1 1 / 1 1 / 1 1 / 1 1 / 1 1 / 1 1 / 1 1 / 1 1 / 1 1 / 1 1 / 1 1 / 1 1 / 1 1 / 1 1 / 1 1 / 1 1 / 1 1 / 1 1 / 1 1 / 1 1 / 1 1 / 1 1 / 1 1 / 1 1 / 1 1 / 1 1 / 1 1 / 1 1 / 1 1 / 1 1 / 1 1 / 1 1 / 1 1 / 1 1 / 1 1 / 1 1 / 1 1 / 1 1 / 1 1 / 1 1 / 1 1 / 1 1 / 1 1 / 1 1 / 1 1 / 1 1 / 1 1 / 1 1 / 1 1 / 1 1 / 1 1 / 1 1 / 1 1 / 1 1 / 1 1 / 1 1 / 1 1 / 1 1 / 1 1 / 1 1 / 1 1 / 1 1 / 1 1 / 1 1 / 1 1 / 1 1 / 1 1 / 1 1 / 1 1 / 1 1 / 1 1 / 1 1 / 1 1 / 1 1 / 1 1 / 1 1 / 1 1 / 1 1 / 1 1 / 1 1 / 1 1 / 1 1 / 1 1 / 1 1 / 1 1 / 1 1 / 1 1 / 1 1 / 1 1 / 1 1 / 1 1 / 1 1 / 1 1 / 1 1 / 1 1 / 1 1 / 1 1 / 1 1 / 1 1 / 1 1 / 1 1 / 1 1 / 1 1 / 1 1 / 1 1 / 1 1 / 1 1 / 1 1 / 1 1 / 1 1 / 1 1 / 1 1 / 1 1 / 1 1 / 1 1 / 1 1 / 1 1 / 1 1 / 1 1 / 1 1 / 1 1 / 1 1 / 1 1 / 1 1 / 1 1 / 1 1 / 1 1 / 1 1 / 1 1 / 1 1 / 1 1 / 1 1 / 1 1 / 1 1 /	 shareholdings debt claims by public authorities granted loans reserves Public enterprises Special funds Financial support for 		1 1 0 0 0			0 / 1 0 / 1	0,7 0,0 0,0 1,0
Economic shocks Other emergencies Compensational mechanism E Content Clear definitions				3			1,0
Clear definitions Borrowing: 2 (speficied in HGrG) Total income: 2 (definitive numerical value) Redemption plan: 2 (time span not specified) Expenditures for personnel: 2 (numerical value) Strict aim Strict rule 2	Economic shocks Other emergencies Compensational		1	1		1 / 1 1 / 1	1,0 1,0 1,0 1,0
HGrG) specified in detail but general understanding, use must be justified) Total income: 2 (definitive numerical value) Total income: 2 (definitive numerical value) Extraordinary emergencies: 1 (not specified, but use must be justified) Redemption plan: 2 (time span not specified) Expenditures for personnel: 2 (numerical value) Strict aim Strict rule Specified in detail but general understanding, use must be justified) Extraordinary emergencies: 1 (not specified, but use must be justified) Redemption plan: 2 (time span not specified) Expenditures for personnel: 2 (numerical value) 2		2		5	3	16 / 20	0,8
Strict aim 2 2 0 4 / 6 Strict rule 2 2 1 6 / 8	Clear definitions		HGrG) Total income: 2 (definitive numerical value) Redemption plan: 2 (time span not specified) Expenditures for personnel:	specified in detail but general understanding, use must be justified) Extraordinary emergencies: 1 (not specified, but use must be justified) Redemption plan: 2 (time			
Strict rule 2 2 1 6 / 8							1,0
		2				, -	0,6 0,7
	Sanctrate			1	Sum	35,75 / 48	0,7