

Web appendix for

Debt Rule Federalism: The Case of Germany

Sarah Ciaglia (Federal Ministry of Finance)

Friedrich Heinemann (ZEW Mannheim and University of Heidelberg)

October 2012

Categories	Part of Rule				Total Points	Std. Points
	Basic rule	Regulations	Relaxations	Sanctions		
Description	BBR: balanced budget DR: max. nominal credit market debt stock	"in principle" no borrowing, max. borrowing equal to the amount of expenditures for investments in order to respond to "demands of the macroeconomic equilibrium" or similar severe situations Not exceed "permanently" nominal credit market debt stock of 2007, higher debt stock allowed if tax income decreases by 1% from one year to another, simultaneously decide a redemption plan for max. 7 years	Borrowing above investments-clause allowed in order to respond to a "disturbance of the macroeconomic equilibrium" Higher debt stock allowed in case of natural catastrophes or similar severe emergencies, simultaneously decide a redemption plan for max. 7 years	A fourth of the Parliament's members or the government can take the budget to the constitutional court; Stability Council monitors enforcement, if a budgetary emergency occurs, the Council sets up and monitors the financial restructuring programme		
A Legal base	BBR: constitution Art. 79 (1) sentence 2, LHO Art. 18 (1); DR: LHO Art. 18 (1) 3	BBR: constitution Art. 79, LHO Art. 18 (1) and Art. 26; DR: LHO Art. 18 (1) 3	BBR: constitution Art. 84 sentence 2, LHO Art. 18 (2); DR: LHO Art. 18 (2) and (3) 3	Constitution Art. 68 (2) No 2; Stability Council: Federal constitution Art. 109a sentence 1 No 2, StabiRatG 4	13 / 16	0,81
B Enforcement mechanisms				There are no specific sanctions (valid for every bill), the Stability Council only monitors the enforcement but cannot sanction defections or impose corrective measures 1	1 / 4	0,25
C Coverage			1,75 0,75 1 1 1 0 0 0 1		1,75 / 4 0,75 / 1	0,44 0,75
D Flexibility			1 1 1 1 1	3 1 1 1 1	4 / 4 1 / 1 1 / 1 1 / 1 1 / 1	1,00 1,00 1,00 1,00 1,00
E Content	2	5	5	3	15 / 20	0,75
Clear definitions		Borrowing: 2 (specified in HGrG) In principle: 0 (referring to business cycle fluctuations: "demands of the macroeconomic equilibrium", also "similar severe situations") Investments: 1 (vague definition in LHO Art. 13 (3) No 2 sentence 2) Debt stock in 2007: 2 (definitive numerical value) Permanently: 2 (referring to "tax income decrease", but time span not specified) Redemption plan: 2 (clear definition of time span and amount of debt that must be paid back)	Disturbance of the macroeconomic equilibrium: 1 (not specified, but the disturbance and that borrowing will help to repel it must be defined by law) Natural catastrophe: 2 (not specified in detail but general understanding, use must be justified) Similar severe emergencies: 1 (not specified, but use must be justified) Redemption plan: 2 (clear definition of time span and amount of debt that must be paid back)	Legal provisions are clearly defined		
Strict aim		2	2	2	6 / 6	1,00
Strict rule	2	1	1	0	2 / 6	0,33
		2	2	1	7 / 8	0,88
Sum					34,75 / 48	
Index score						0,65

BE - from 2020 on

Categories	Part of Rule				Total Points	Std. Points
	Basic rule	Regulations	Relaxations	Sanctions		
Description	BBR balanced budget	If there are no other financial means to cover expenditures, borrowing is allowed up until an amount equal to the amount of expenditures for investments	Borrowing above investments-clause allowed in order to respond to a "disturbance of the macroeconomic equilibrium"	A fourth of the Parliament's members or the government can take the budget to the constitutional court; Stability Council monitors enforcement, if a budgetary emergency occurs, the Council sets up and monitors the financial restructuring programme		
A Legal base	BBR: constitution Art. 87	BBR: constitution Art. 87, LHO Art. 18	BBR: constitution Art. 87, LHO Art. 18	Constitution Art. 84 (2) No 3; Stability Council: Federal constitution Art. 109a sentence 1 No 2, StabiRatG	16 / 16	1,00
B Enforcement mechanisms	4	4	4	4	1 / 4	0,25
C Coverage						
Official budget:		1,75			1,75 / 4	0,44
- shareholdings		0,75			0,75 / 1	0,75
- debt claims by public authorities		1				
- granted loans		1				
- reserves		1				
Public enterprises		0			0 / 1	0,00
Special funds		0			0 / 1	0,00
Financial support for local authorities		1			1 / 1	1,00
D Flexibility					1 / 4	0,25
Business cycle		0		1	0 / 1	0,00
Economic shocks				1	1 / 1	1,00
Other emergencies				0	0 / 1	0,00
Compensational mechanism				0	0 / 1	0,00
E Content	1	2	1	3	7 / 20	0,35
Clear definitions		Borrowing: 2 (specified in HGrG)	Disturbance of the macroeconomic equilibrium: 1 (not specified, but the disturbance and that borrowing will help to repel it must be defined by law)	Legal provisions are clearly defined		
		Investments: 1 (vague definition in LHO Art. 13 (3) No 2 sentence 2)				
Strict aim		2	1	2	5 / 6	0,83
Strict rule	1	0	0	0	0 / 6	0,00
		0	0	1	2 / 8	0,25
Sum					26,75 / 48	
Index score						0,46

Categories	Part of Rule				Total Points	Std. Points
	Basic rule	Regulations	Relaxations	Sanctions		
Description	BBR: Balanced budget	Max. borrowing equal to the amount of expenditures for investments (incl. macroeconomic equilibrium and protection of natural living conditions of present and future generations)	Borrowing above investments-clause allowed in order to respond to a "disturbance of the macroeconomic equilibrium"	A fifth of the Parliament's members or the government can take the budget to the constitutional court; Stability Council monitors enforcement, if a budgetary emergency occurs, the Council sets up and monitors the financial restructuring programme		
A Legal base	Constitution Art. 101 (2) sentence 4	Constitution Art. 103 (1) sentence 2 and Art. 101 (1), LHO Art. 18 (1)	Constitution Art. 103 (1) sentence 3	Constitution Art. 68(2) No 2; Stability Council: Federal constitution Art. 109a sentence 1 No 2, StabiRatG	16 / 16	1,00
B Enforcement mechanisms				There are no specific sanctions (valid for every bill), the Stability Council only monitors the enforcement but cannot sanction defections or impose corrective measures	1 / 4	0,25
C Coverage					1,75 / 4	0,44
Official budget:		1,75			0,75 / 1	0,75
- shareholdings		1				
- debt claims by public authorities		1				
- granted loans		1				
- reserves		0				
Public enterprises		0			0 / 1	0,00
Special funds		0			0 / 1	0,00
Financial support for local authorities		1			1 / 1	1,00
D Flexibility					2 / 4	0,50
Business cycle		1			1 / 1	1,00
Economic shocks				1	1 / 1	1,00
Other emergencies				0	0 / 1	0,00
Compensational mechanism				0	0 / 1	0,00
E Content					9 / 20	0,45
Clear definitions	1	4	1	3		
		Borrowing: 2 (specified in HGrG)	Disturbance of the macroeconomic equilibrium: 1 (not specified, but the disturbance and that borrowing will help to repel it must be defined by law)	Legal provisions are clearly defined		
		Investments: 2 (definition in LHO Art. 13 (3) No 2 sentence 2 and VV-HH 3.2.1.1)				
		Natural living conditions: 1 (not specified but explicitly related to nature)				
Strict aim		2	1	2	5 / 6	0,83
Strict rule	1	2	0	0	2 / 6	0,33
		0	0	1	2 / 8	0,25
Sum					29,75 / 48	
Index score						0,53

HB - from 2020 on

Categories	Part of Rule				Total Points	Std. Points
	Basic rule	Regulations	Relaxations	Sanctions		
Description	BBR: balanced budget	Max. borrowing equal to the amount of expenditures for investments	Borrowing above investments-clause allowed in order to respond to a "disturbance of the macroeconomic equilibrium"	A fifth of the Parliament 's members, the government or another institution under public law can take the budget to the constitutional court; Stability Council monitors enforcement, if a budgetary emergency occurs, the Council sets up and monitors the financial restructuring programme		
A Legal base	Constitution Art. 131a sentence 2 4	Constitution Art. 131a sentence 2, LHO Art. 18 (1) 4	Constitution Art. 131a sentence 2, LHO Art. 18 (1) 4	Constitution Art. 140 (1); Stability Council: Federal constitution Art. 109a sentence 1 No 2, StabiRatG 4	16 / 16	1,00
B Enforcement mechanisms				There are no specific sanctions (valid for every bill), the Stability Council only monitors the enforcement but cannot sanction defections or impose corrective measures 1	1 / 4	0,25
C Coverage						
Official budget:		1,75			1,75 / 4	0,44
- shareholdings		0,75			0,75 / 1	0,75
- debt claims by public authorities		1				
- granted loans		1				
- reserves		0				
Public enterprises		0			0 / 1	0,00
Special funds		0			0 / 1	0,00
Financial support for local authorities		1			1 / 1	1,00
D Flexibility						
Business cycle		0	1		1 / 4	0,25
Economic shocks		0			0 / 1	0,00
Other emergencies			1		1 / 1	1,00
Compensational mechanism			0		0 / 1	0,00
			0		0 / 1	0,00
E Content						
Clear definitions	1	2	0	3	6 / 20	0,30
		Borrowing: 2 (specified in HGrG)	Disturbance of the macroeconomic equilibrium: 0 (not specified)	Legal provisions are clearly defined		
		Investments: 1 (vague definition in LHO Art. 13 (3) No 2 sentence 2)				
Strict aim		2	0	2	4 / 6	0,67
Strict rule	1	0	0	0	0 / 6	0,00
		0	0	1	2 / 8	0,25
Sum					25,75 / 48	
Index score						0,45

Categories	Part of Rule				Total Points	Std. Points
	Basic rule	Regulations	Relaxations	Sanctions		
Description	BBR: balanced budget	Max. borrowing equal to the amount of expenditures for investments	Borrowing above investments-clause allowed in case of "extraordinary demands" (LHO: "disturbance of the macroeconomic equilibrium")	A fifth of the Parliament's members or the government can take the budget to the constitutional court; Stability Council monitors enforcement, if a budgetary emergency occurs, the Council sets up and monitors the financial restructuring programme		
A Legal base	Constitution Art. 66 (1) sentence 2	Constitution Art. 72 (1), LHO Art. 18 (1)	Constitution Art. 72 (1), LHO Art. 18 (1)	Constitution Art. 65 (3) No 3; Stability Council: Federal constitution Art. 109a sentence 1 No 2, StabiRatG	15 / 16	0,94
B Enforcement mechanisms				There are no specific sanctions (valid for every bill), the Stability Council only monitors the enforcement but cannot sanction defections or impose corrective measures	1 / 4	0,25
C Coverage					1,75 / 4	0,44
Official budget:		1,75			0,75 / 1	0,75
- shareholdings		1				
- debt claims by public authorities		1				
- granted loans		1				
- reserves		0				
Public enterprises		0			0 / 1	0,00
Special funds		0			0 / 1	0,00
Financial support for local authorities		1			1 / 1	1,00
D Flexibility					1 / 4	0,25
Business cycle		0			0 / 1	0,00
Economic shocks					1 / 1	1,00
Other emergencies					0 / 1	0,00
Compensational mechanism					0 / 1	0,00
E Content					6 / 20	0,30
Clear definitions	1	2	0	3		
		Borrowing: 2 (specified in HGrG)	Disturbance of the macroeconomic equilibrium: 0 (not specified)	Legal provisions are clearly defined		
		Investments: 1 (vague definition in LHO Art. 13 (3) No 2 sentence 2)				
Strict aim		2	0	2	4 / 6	0,67
Strict rule		0	0	0	0 / 6	0,00
	1	0	0	1	2 / 8	0,25
Sum					24,75 / 48	
Index score						0,44

Categories	Part of Rule				Total Points	Std. Points
	Basic rule	Regulations	Relaxations	Sanctions		
Description	BBR: balanced budget	Max. borrowing equal to the amount of expenditures for investments	Borrowing above investments-clause allowed in case of "extraordinary demands" and in order to respond to a "disturbance of the macroeconomic equilibrium"	A tenth of the Parliament's members, the government, the prime minister or one hundredth of all people eligible to vote can take the budget to the constitutional court; Stability Council monitors enforcement, if a budgetary emergency occurs, the Council sets up and monitors the financial restructuring programme		
A Legal base	Constitution Art. 141, LHO Art. 18 (1) 4	Constitution Art. 141, LHO Art. 18 (1) 4	Constitution Art. 141, LHO Art. 18 (1) 4	Constitution Art. 131; Stability Council: Federal constitution Art. 109a sentence 1 No 2, StabiRatG 4	16 / 16	1,00
B Enforcement mechanisms				There are no specific sanctions (valid for every bill), the Stability Council only monitors the enforcement but cannot sanction defections or impose corrective measures 1	1 / 4	0,25
C Coverage						
Official budget:		1,75			1,75 / 4	0,44
- shareholdings		0,75			0,75 / 1	0,75
- debt claims by public authorities		1				
- granted loans		1				
- reserves		0				
Public enterprises		0			0 / 1	0,00
Special funds		0			0 / 1	0,00
Financial support for local authorities		1			1 / 1	1,00
D Flexibility						
Business cycle		0	2		2 / 4	0,50
Economic shocks					0 / 1	0,00
Other emergencies			1		1 / 1	1,00
Compensational mechanism			0		1 / 1	1,00
					0 / 1	0,00
E Content						
Clear definitions	1	2	0	3	6 / 20	0,30
		Borrowing: 2 (specified in HGrG)	Extraordinary demands: 0 (not specified)	Legal provisions are clearly defined		
		Investments: 1 (vague definition in LHO Art. 13 (3) No 2 sentence 2)	Disturbance of the macroeconomic equilibrium: 0 (not specified)			
Strict aim		2	0	2	4 / 6	0,67
Strict rule	1	0	0	0	0 / 6	0,00
		0	0	1	2 / 8	0,25
Sum					26,75 / 48	
Index score						0,50

HE - from 2020 on¹

Categories	Part of Rule				Total Points	Std. Points
	Basic rule	Regulations	Relaxations	Sanctions		
Description	BBR: balanced budget	"in principle" no borrowing, symmetric response to business cycle fluctuations	Borrowing allowed in case of natural catastrophes or extraordinary emergencies, simultaneously decide redemption plan (adequat time span)	A tenth of the Parliament's members, the government, the prime minister or one hundredth of all people eligible to vote can take the budget to the constitutional court; Stability Council monitors enforcement, if a budgetary emergency occurs, the Council sets up and monitors the financial restructuring programme		
A Legal base	Constitution Art. 141	Constitution Art. 141	Constitution Art. 141, LHO Art. 18 (1)	Constitution Art. 131; Stability Council: Federal constitution Art. 109a sentence 1 No 2, StabiRatG	16 / 16	1,00
B Enforcement mechanisms	4	4	4	4	1 / 4	0,25
C Coverage						
Official budget:		1,75			1,75 / 4	0,44
- shareholdings		0,75			0,75 / 1	0,75
- debt claims by public authorities		1				
- granted loans		1				
- reserves		0				
Public enterprises		0			0 / 1	0,00
Special funds		0			0 / 1	0,00
Financial support for local authorities		1			1 / 1	1,00
D Flexibility					4 / 4	1,00
Business cycle		1	3		1 / 1	1,00
Economic shocks			1		1 / 1	1,00
Other emergencies			1		1 / 1	1,00
Compensational mechanism			1		1 / 1	1,00
E Content	1	4	4	3	12 / 20	0,60
Clear definitions		Borrowing: 2 (specified in HGrG)	Natural catastrophe: 2 (not specified in detail but general understanding, use must be justified)	Legal provisions are clearly defined		
		In principle: 2 (referring to business cycle fluctuations)	Extraordinary emergencies: 1 (term not clear, but use must be justified)			
		Business cycle: 1 ("symmetric response" as vague measurement, LHO needed)	Redemption plan: 2 (time span not specified)			
		2	2	2	6 / 6	1,00
Strict aim		1	1	0	2 / 6	0,33
Strict rule	1	1	1	1	4 / 8	0,50
					Sum	34,75 / 48
					Index score	0,66

¹ Current LHO only valid until 31.12.2012

NI

Categories	Part of Rule				Total Points	Std. Points
	Basic rule	Regulations	Relaxations	Sanctions		
Description	BBR: balanced budget	Max. borrowing equal to the amount of expenditures for investments	Borrowing above investments-clause allowed in order to respond to a "disturbance of the macroeconomic equilibrium" or to a threat to "natural living conditions"	A fifth of the Parliament's members or the government can take the budget to the constitutional court; Stability Council monitors enforcement, if a budgetary emergency occurs, the Council sets up and monitors the financial restructuring programme		
A Legal base	Constitution Art. 65 (1)	Constitution Art. 71 sentence 2, LHO Art. 18 (1)	Constitution Art. 71 sentence 2, LHO Art. 18 (1)	Constitution Art. 54 sentence 1 No 2, Stability Council: Federal constitution Art. 109a sentence 1 No 2, StabiRatG	16 / 16	1,00
B Enforcement mechanisms				There are no specific sanctions (valid for every bill), the Stability Council only monitors the enforcement but cannot sanction defections or impose corrective measures	1 / 4	0,25
C Coverage					1,75 / 4	0,44
Official budget:		1,75			0,75 / 1	0,75
- shareholdings		0,75				
- debt claims by public authorities		1				
- granted loans		1				
- reserves		0				
Public enterprises		0			0 / 1	0,00
Special funds		0			0 / 1	0,00
Financial support for local authorities		1			1 / 1	1,00
D Flexibility					2 / 4	0,50
Business cycle		0			0 / 1	0,00
Economic shocks					1 / 1	1,00
Other emergencies					1 / 1	1,00
Compensational mechanism					0 / 1	0,00
E Content					7 / 20	0,35
Clear definitions	1	2	1	3		
		Borrowing: 2 (specified in HGrG)	Disturbance of the macroeconomic equilibrium: 1 (not specified, but the disturbance and that borrowing will help to repel it must be defined by law)	Legal provisions are clearly defined		
		Investments: 1 (vague definition in LHO Art. 13 (3) No 2 sentence 2)	Natural living conditions: 1 (not specified but explicitly related to nature)			
Strict aim		2	1	2	5 / 6	0,83
Strict rule	1	0	0	0	0 / 6	0,00
		0	0	1	2 / 8	0,25
Sum					27,75 / 48	
Index score						0,51

Categories	Part of Rule				Total Points	Std. Points
	Basic rule	Regulations	Relaxations	Sanctions		
Description	BBR: balanced budget	Max. borrowing equal to the amount of expenditures for investments	Borrowing above investments-clause allowed in order to respond to a "disturbance of the macroeconomic equilibrium"	A third of the Parliament's members or the government can take the budget to the constitutional court; Stability Council monitors enforcement, if a budgetary emergency occurs, the Council sets up and monitors the financial restructuring programme		
A Legal base	Constitution Art. 65 (2), LHO Art. 18 (1)	Constitution Art. 65 (2), LHO Art. 18 (1)	Constitution Art. 65 (2), LHO Art. 18 (1)	Constitution Art. 53 sentence 1 No 2, Stability Council: Federal constitution Art. 109a sentence 1 No 2, StabiRatG	16 / 16	1,00
B Enforcement mechanisms				There are no specific sanctions (valid for every bill), the Stability Council only monitors the enforcement but cannot sanction defections or impose corrective measures	1 / 4	0,25
C Coverage					1,75 / 4	0,44
Official budget:		1,75			0,75 / 1	0,75
- shareholdings		0,75				
- debt claims by public authorities		1				
- granted loans		1				
- reserves		0				
Public enterprises		0			0 / 1	0,00
Special funds		0			0 / 1	0,00
Financial support for local authorities		1			1 / 1	1,00
D Flexibility					1 / 4	0,25
Business cycle		0	1		0 / 1	0,00
Economic shocks		0		1	1 / 1	1,00
Other emergencies				0	0 / 1	0,00
Compensational mechanism				0	0 / 1	0,00
E Content					7 / 20	0,35
Clear definitions	1	2	1	3		
		Borrowing: 2 (specified in HGrG)	Disturbance of the macroeconomic equilibrium: 1 (not specified, but the disturbance and that borrowing will help to repel it must be defined by law)	Legal provisions are clearly defined		
		Investments: 1 (vague definition in LHO Art. 13 (3) No 2 sentence 2)				
Strict aim		2	1	2	5 / 6	0,83
Strict rule	1	0	0	0	0 / 6	0,00
		0	0	1	2 / 8	0,25
Sum					26,75 / 48	
Index score						0,46

MV - from 2020 on¹

Categories	Part of Rule				Total Points	Std. Points
	Basic rule	Regulations	Relaxations	Sanctions		
Description	BBR: balanced budget	"in principle" no borrowing, symmetric adaption to business cycle fluctuations	Borrowing allowed in order to respond to natural catastrophes and extraordinary emergencies, simultaneously decide a redemption plan (adequat time span)	A third of the Parliament's members or the government can take the budget to the constitutional court; Stability Council monitors enforcement, if a budgetary emergency occurs, the Council sets up and monitors the financial restructuring programme		
A Legal base	Constitution Art. 65 (2) 4	Constitution Art. 65 (2) 4	Constitution Art. 65 (2) 4	Constitution Art. 53 sentence 1 No 2; Stability Council: Federal constitution Art. 109a sentence 1 No 2, StabiRatG 4	16 / 16	1,00
B Enforcement mechanisms				There are no specific sanctions (valid for every bill), the Stability Council only monitors the enforcement but cannot sanction defections or impose corrective measures 1	1 / 4	0,25
C Coverage						
Official budget:		1,75			1,75 / 4	0,44
- shareholdings		0,75			0,75 / 1	0,75
- debt claims by public authorities		1				
- granted loans		1				
- reserves		0				
Public enterprises		0			0 / 1	0,00
Special funds		0			0 / 1	0,00
Financial support for local authorities		1			1 / 1	1,00
D Flexibility						
Business cycle		1	3		4 / 4	1,00
Economic shocks		1			1 / 1	1,00
Other emergencies			1		1 / 1	1,00
Compensational mechanism			1		1 / 1	1,00
E Content						
Clear definitions	1	4	4	3	11 / 20	0,55
		Borrowing: 2 (specified in HGrG)	Natural catastrophe: 2 (not specified in detail but general understanding, use must be justified)	Legal provisions are clearly defined		
		In principle: 2 (referring to business cycle fluctuations)	Extraordinary emergencies: 1 (not specified, but use must be justified)			
		Business cycle: 1 ("symmetric response" as vague measurement, LHO needed)	Redemption plan: 2 (time span not specified)			
Strict aim		2	2	2	6 / 6	1,00
Strict rule		1	1	0	2 / 6	0,33
	1	1	1	1	4 / 8	0,50
Sum					33,75 / 48	
Index score						0,65

¹ No appropriate LHO decided, yet.

Categories	Part of Rule				Total Points	Std. Points
	Basic rule	Regulations	Relaxations	Sanctions		
Description	BBR: balanced budget	Max. borrowing equal to the amount of expenditures for investments	Borrowing above investments-clause allowed in order to respond to a "disturbance of the macroeconomic equilibrium"	A third of the Parliament's members or the government can take the budget to the constitutional court; Stability Council monitors enforcement, if a budgetary emergency occurs, the Council sets up and monitors the financial restructuring programme		
A Legal base	Constitution Art. 83 sentence 2, LHO Art. 18 (1)	Constitution Art. 83 sentence 2, LHO Art. 18 (1)	LHO Art. 18 (1) sentence 2	Constitution Art. 75 sentence 1 No 3, Stability Council: Federal constitution Art. 109a sentence 1 No 2, StabiRatG	15 / 16	0,94
B Enforcement mechanisms				There are no specific sanctions (valid for every bill), the Stability Council only monitors the enforcement but cannot sanction defections or impose corrective measures	1 / 4	0,25
C Coverage					1,75 / 4	0,44
Official budget:		1,75			0,75 / 1	0,75
- shareholdings		0,75				
- debt claims by public authorities		1				
- granted loans		1				
- reserves		0				
Public enterprises		0			0 / 1	0,00
Special funds		0			0 / 1	0,00
Financial support for local authorities		1			1 / 1	1,00
D Flexibility					1 / 4	0,25
Business cycle		0	1		0 / 1	0,00
Economic shocks		0			1 / 1	1,00
Other emergencies			1		0 / 1	0,00
Compensational mechanism			0		0 / 1	0,00
			0		0 / 1	0,00
E Content					7 / 20	0,35
Clear definitions	1	2	1	3		
		Borrowing: 2 (specified in HGrG)	Disturbance of the macroeconomic equilibrium: 1 (not specified, but the disturbance and that borrowing will help to repel it must be defined by law)	Legal provisions are clearly defined		
		Investments: 1 (vague definition in LHO Art. 13 (3) No 2 sentence 2)				
Strict aim		2	1	2	5 / 6	0,83
Strict rule	1	0	0	0	0 / 6	0,00
		0	0	1	2 / 8	0,25
Sum					25,75 / 48	
Index score						0,45

RP - from 2020 on¹

Categories	Part of Rule				Total Points	Std. Points
	Basic rule	Regulations	Relaxations	Sanctions		
Description	BBR: balanced budget	"in principle" no borrowing (considering also borrowing by state owned or state controlled bodies), symmetric adaption to business cycle fluctuations	Borrowing allowed in order to respond to natural catastrophes, extraordinary emergencies, max. four-years-long adaptation to legal changes targeting the income or expenditure side of the budget, simultaneously decide a redemption plan (considering business cycle fluctuations)	The Parliament, a parliamentary group ("Fraktion") or the government can take the budget to the constitutional court; Stability Council monitors enforcement, if a budgetary emergency occurs, the Council sets up and monitors the financial restructuring programme		
A Legal base	Constitution Art. 117	Constitution Art. 117	Constitution Art. 117	Constitution Art. 130 (1); Stability Council: Federal constitution Art. 109a sentence 1 No 2, StabiRatG	16 / 16	1,00
B Enforcement mechanisms				There are no specific sanctions (valid for every bill), the Stability Council only monitors the enforcement but cannot sanction defections or impose corrective measures	1 / 4	0,25
C Coverage					3,75 / 4	0,94
Official budget:		3,75			0,75 / 1	0,75
- shareholdings		1				
- debt claims by public authorities		1				
- granted loans		1				
- reserves		0				
Public enterprises		1			1 / 1	1,00
Special funds		1			1 / 1	1,00
Financial support for local authorities		1			1 / 1	1,00
D Flexibility					4 / 4	1,00
Business cycle		1			1 / 1	1,00
Economic shocks					1 / 1	1,00
Other emergencies					1 / 1	1,00
Compensational mechanism					1 / 1	1,00
E Content					14 / 20	0,70
Clear definitions	1	5	5	3		
		Borrowing: 2 (structural deficit, LHO will define calculation precisely)	Natural catastrophe: 2 (not specified in detail but general understanding, use must be justified)	Legal provisions are clearly defined		
		In principle: 2 (referring to business cycle fluctuations)	Extraordinary emergencies: 1 (not specified, but use must be justified)			
		Business cycle: 1 ("symmetric adaption" as vague measurement, LHO needed)	Legal changes: 2 (clearly formulated)			
			Redemption plan: 1 (time span not specified, but amount of debt that must be payed back)			
		2	2	2	6 / 6	1,00
Strict aim		1	1	0	2 / 6	0,33
Strict rule	1	2	2	1	6 / 8	0,75
Sum					38,75 / 48	
Index score						0,78

¹ No appropriate LHO decided, yet.

Categories	Part of Rule				Total Points	Std. Points
	Basic rule	Regulations	Relaxations	Sanctions		
Description	BBR: balanced budget BBR (KonsHilfG): numerical limits for structural deficit until 2019	Max. borrowing equal to the amount of expenditures for investments Decrease structural deficit along chain	Borrowing above investments-clause allowed in order to respond to a "disturbance of the macroeconomic equilibrium" or to "extraordinary demands", redemption plan in case of "extraordinary demands" Structural deficit above limits allowed in case of exceptional situations (must be approved by the Stability Council)	A third of the Parliament's members or the government can take the budget to the constitutional court; Stability Council monitors enforcement, if a budgetary emergency occurs, the Council sets up and monitors the financial restructuring programme Financial Support is cut off if Stability Council considers limits exceeded		
A Legal base	Constitution Art. 105 (1) sentence 2, KonsHilfG Art. 2, VV KonsHilfG Art. 4	Constitution Art. 108 (2), LHO Art. 18 (1), KonsHilfG Art. 2, VV KonsHilfG	Constitution Art. 108 (2), LHO Art. 18 (1), VV KonsHilfG Art. 6	Constitution Art. 97 sentence 1 No 2; Stability Council: Federal constitution Art. 109a sentence 1 No 2, StabiRatG, VV KonsHilfG Art. 8	12 / 16	0,75
B Enforcement mechanisms				Financial support is cut off, implicit obligation for corrective measures	3 / 4	0,75
C Coverage					1,75 / 4	0,44
Official budget:		1,75			0,75 / 1	0,75
- shareholdings		0,75				
- debt claims by public authorities		1				
- granted loans		1				
- reserves		1				
Public enterprises		0			0 / 1	0,00
Special funds		0			0 / 1	0,00
Financial support for local authorities		1			1 / 1	1,00
D Flexibility					3 / 4	0,75
Business cycle		0	3		0 / 1	0,00
Economic shocks				1	1 / 1	1,00
Other emergencies				1	1 / 1	1,00
Compensational mechanism				1	1 / 1	1,00
E Content					17 / 20	0,85
Clear definitions	2	6	4	5		
		Borrowing: 2 (specified in HGrG)	Disturbance of the macroeconomic equilibrium: 1 (not specified, but the disturbance and that borrowing will help to repel it must be defined by law)	Legal provisions are clearly defined		
		Investments: 2 (vague definition in LHO Art. 13 (3) No 2 sentence 2, specified definition for constructions of buildings in Appendix 7 VV No 15.2 concerning LHO Art. 44)	Extraordinary demands: 1 (not specified, but the disturbance and that borrowing will help to repel it must be defined by law)	Exceeded limit: 2 (numerical definition, but: vulnerable to interpretation of "exceptional situations")		
		Structural deficit: 2 (clear definition and method for calculation in VV KonsHilfG)	Redemption plan: 1 (time span not specified, but amount of debt that must be payed back)			
			Exceptional situations: 0 (not specified, Stability Council is free to determine a situation as exceptional)			
Strict aim			2	2	5 / 6	0,83
Strict rule			2	1	4 / 6	0,67
	2	2	2	2	8 / 8	1,00
Sum					36,75 / 48	
Index score						0,71

SL - from 2020 on

Categories	Part of Rule				Total Points	Std. Points
	Basic rule	Regulations	Relaxations	Sanctions		
Description	BBR: balanced budget	Max. borrowing equal to the amount of expenditures for investments	Borrowing above investments-clause allowed in order to respond to a "disturbance of the macroeconomic equilibrium" or to "extraordinary demands", redemption plan in case of "extraordinary demands"	A third of the Parliament's members or the government can take the budget to the constitutional court; Stability Council monitors enforcement, if a budgetary emergency occurs, the Council sets up and monitors the financial restructuring programme		
A Legal base	Constitution Art. 105 (1) sentence 2	Constitution Art. 108 (2), LHO Art. 18 (1)	Constitution Art. 108 (2), LHO Art. 18 (1)	Constitution Art. 97 sentence 1 No 2; Stability Council: Federal constitution Art. 109a sentence 1 No 2, StabiRatG	16 / 16	1,00
B Enforcement mechanisms				There are no specific sanctions (valid for every bill), the Stability Council only monitors the enforcement but cannot sanction defections or impose corrective measures	1 / 4	0,25
C Coverage						
Official budget:		1,75			1,75 / 4	0,44
- shareholdings		0,75			0,75 / 1	0,75
- debt claims by public authorities		1				
- granted loans		1				
- reserves		1				
Public enterprises		0			0 / 1	0,00
Special funds		0			0 / 1	0,00
Financial support for local authorities		1			1 / 1	1,00
D Flexibility					3 / 4	0,75
Business cycle		0	3		0 / 1	0,00
Economic shocks			1		1 / 1	1,00
Other emergencies			1		1 / 1	1,00
Compensational mechanism			1		1 / 1	1,00
E Content					8 / 20	0,40
Clear definitions	1	2	2	3		
		Borrowing: 2 (specified in HGrG)	Disturbance of the macroeconomic equilibrium: 1 (not specified, but the disturbance and that borrowing will help to repel it must be defined by law)	Legal provisions are clearly defined		
		Investments: 2 (vague definition in LHO Art. 13 (3) No 2 sentence 2, specified definition for constructions of buildings in Appendix 7 VV No 15.2 concerning LHO Art. 44)	Extraordinary demands: 1 (not specified, but the disturbance and that borrowing will help to repel it must be defined by law)			
			Redemption plan: 1 (time span not specified, but amount of debt that must be payed back)			
Strict aim		2	1	2	5 / 6	0,83
Strict rule	1	0	0	0	0 / 6	0,00
		1	1	1	3 / 8	0,38
					Sum	29,75 / 48
					Index score	0,57

Categories	Part of Rule				Total Points	Std. Points	
	Basic rule	Regulations	Relaxations	Sanctions			
Description	BBR: balanced budget DR: max. nominal credit market debt stock	Max. borrowing equal to the amount of expenditures for investments Not exceed "permanently" nominal credit market debt stock of 2008; Higher debt stock allowed if tax income decreases by 3% from one year to another	Borrowing above investments-clause allowed in order to respond to a "disturbance of the macroeconomic equilibrium" Higher debt stock allowed in case of natural catastrophes or similar severe emergencies (their impact is of supra-regional character); simultaneously decide a redemption plan for max. 5 years	A fourth of the Parliament 's members or the government can take the budget to the constitutional court; Stability Council monitors enforcement, if a budgetary emergency occurs, the Council sets up and monitors the financial restructuring programme			
A Legal base	BBR: constitution Art. 93 (1) sentence 2, LHO Art. 18 (1); DR: LHO Art. 18 (1)	BBR: constitution Art. 95 sentence 2, LHO Art. 18; DR: LHO Art. 18	BBR: constitution Art. 95 sentence 2, LHO Art. 18; DR: LHO Art. 18	Constitution Art. 81 (1) No 2; Stability Council: Federal constitution Art. 109a sentence 1 No 2, StabiRatG	13 / 16	0,81	
B Enforcement mechanisms				There are no specific sanctions (valid for every bill), the Stability Council only monitors the enforcement but cannot sanction defections or impose corrective measures	1 / 4	0,25	
C Coverage			1,75		1,75 / 4	0,44	
Official budget:			0,75		0,75 / 1	0,75	
- shareholdings			1				
- debt claims by public authorities			1				
- granted loans			1				
- reserves			0				
Public enterprises			0		0 / 1	0,00	
Special funds			0		0 / 1	0,00	
Financial support for local authorities			1		1 / 1	1,00	
D Flexibility			1	3	4 / 4	1,00	
Business cycle			1		1 / 1	1,00	
Economic shocks				1	1 / 1	1,00	
Other emergencies				1	1 / 1	1,00	
Compensational mechanism				1	1 / 1	1,00	
E Content			6	6	17 / 20	0,85	
Clear definitions		Borrowing: 2 (specified in HGRG) Investments: 1 (vague definition in LHO Art. 13 (3) No 2 sentence 2) Debt stock in 2008: 2 (definitive numerical value) Tax income decrease: 2 (clear numerical definition)	Disturbance of the macroeconomic equilibrium: 1 (not specified, but the disturbance and that borrowing will help to repel it must be defined by law) Natural catastrophe: 2 (not specified in detail but general understanding, use must be justified) Similar severe emergencies: 2 ("supranational character", use must be justified) Redemption plan: 2	Legal provisions are clearly defined			
Strict aim			2	2	2	6 / 6	1,00
Strict rule			2	2	0	4 / 6	0,67
			2	2	1	7 / 8	0,88
Sum					36,75 / 48		
Index score						0,67	

ST - from 2020 on

Categories	Part of Rule				Total Points	Std. Points
	Basic rule	Regulations	Relaxations	Sanctions		
Description	BBR: balanced budget DR: debt must decrease	Borrowing allowed in order to respond to business cycle fluctuations, simultaneously decide about redemption plan (adequate time span, latest beginning four years after borrowing) Define yearly (at best constant) amounts for redemption, spend additional tax income on redemption	Higher borrowing allowed in case of natural catastrophes or extraordinary emergencies, simultaneously decide about redemption plan (adequate time span, latest beginning four years after borrowing)	A fourth of the Parliament 's members or the government can take the budget to the constitutional court; Stability Council monitors enforcement, if a budgetary emergency occurs, the Council sets up and monitors the financial restructuring programme		
A Legal base	BBR: constitution Art. 93 (1) sentence 2, LHO Art. 18 (1); DR: LHO Art. 18 (4) 3	BBR: LHO Art. 18; DR: LHO Art. 18 (4) 3	BBR: LHO Art. 18; DR: LHO Art. 18 (4) 3	Constitution Art. 75 sentence 1 No 3; Stability Council: Federal constitution Art. 109a sentence 1 No 2, StabiRatG 4	13 / 16	0,81
B Enforcement mechanisms				There are no specific sanctions (valid for every bill), the Stability Council only monitors the enforcement but cannot sanction defections or impose corrective measures 1	1 / 4	0,25
C Coverage						
Official budget:		1,75			1,75 / 4	0,44
- shareholdings		0,75			0,75 / 1	0,75
- debt claims by public authorities		1				
- granted loans		1				
- reserves		0				
Public enterprises		0			0 / 1	0,00
Special funds		0			0 / 1	0,00
Financial support for local authorities		1			1 / 1	1,00
D Flexibility					4 / 4	1,00
Business cycle		1	3		1 / 1	1,00
Economic shocks			1		1 / 1	1,00
Other emergencies			1		1 / 1	1,00
Compensational mechanism			1		1 / 1	1,00
E Content					15 / 20	0,75
Clear definitions	2	5	4	4		
		Borrowing: 2 (structural deficit)	Natural catastrophe: 2 (not specified in detail but general understanding, use must be justified)	Legal provisions are clearly defined		
		Business cycle: 2 (measurement not specified, but use must be justified, LHO needed)	Extraordinary emergencies: 1 (not specified, but use must be justified)			
		Redemption plan: 2 (time span not specified)	Redemption plan: 2 (time span not specified)			
		Debt stock decrease: 2 (use of additional tax income specified)				
Strict aim		2	2	2	6 / 6	1,00
Strict rule	2	2	1	1	3 / 6	0,50
				1	6 / 8	0,75
					Sum	34,75 / 48
					Index score	0,65

Categories	Part of Rule				Total Points	Std. Points
	Basic rule	Regulations	Relaxations	Sanctions		
Description	BBR: balanced budget	Borrowing allowed in order to respond to business cycle fluctuations	Higher borrowing allowed in case of natural catastrophes or extraordinary emergencies (two-thirds majority), simultaneously decide redemption plan (adequate time span)	A third of the Parliament's members, two parliamentary groups or the government can take the budget to the constitutional court; Stability Council monitors enforcement, if a budgetary emergency occurs, the Council sets up and monitors the financial restructuring programme, Financial Support is cut off if Stability Council considers limits exceeded		
	BBR (KonsHilfG): numerical limits for structural deficit until 2019	Decrease structural deficit along chain	Structural deficit above limits allowed in case of exceptional situations (must be approved by the Stability Council)			
A Legal base	Constitution Art. 53 (1), KonsHilfG Art. 2, VV KonsHilfG Art. 4	Constitution Art. 53 (2), KonsHilfG Art. 2, VV KonsHilfG	Constitution Art. 53 (3) and (5), VV KonsHilfG Art. 6	Constitution Art. 44 (2) No 2, Stability Council: Federal constitution Art. 109a sentence 1 No 2, StabiRatG, VV KonsHilfG Art. 8	14 / 16	0,88
B Enforcement mechanisms				Financial support is cut off, implicit obligation for corrective measures	3 / 4	0,75
C Coverage					1,75 / 4	0,44
Official budget:		1,75			0,75 / 1	0,75
- shareholdings		1				
- debt claims by public authorities		1				
- granted loans		1				
- reserves		0				
Public enterprises		0			0 / 1	0,00
Special funds		0			0 / 1	0,00
Financial support for local authorities		1			1 / 1	1,00
D Flexibility					4 / 4	1,00
Business cycle		1	3		1 / 1	1,00
Economic shocks			1		1 / 1	1,00
Other emergencies			1		1 / 1	1,00
Compensational mechanism			1		1 / 1	1,00
E Content					17 / 20	0,85
Clear definitions		Borrowing: 2 (structural deficit)	Natural catastrophe: 2 (not specified in detail but general understanding, use must be justified)	Legal provisions clearly defined		
		Business cycle: 1 (measurement not specified, but use must be justified, LHO needed)	Extraordinary emergencies: 1 (not specified, but two-thirds majority must define it)	Exceeded limit: 2 (numerical definition, but: vulnerable to interpretation of "exceptional situations")		
		Structural deficit: 2 (clear definition and method for calculation in VV KonsHilfG)	Redemption plan: 2 (time span not specified)			
			Exceptional situations: 0 (not specified, Stability Council is free to determine a situation as exceptional)			
Strict aim		2	1	2	5 / 6	0,83
Strict rule		2	1	1	4 / 6	0,67
		2	2	2	8 / 8	1,00
					Sum	39,75 / 48
					Index score	0,78

Categories	Part of Rule				Total Points	Std. Points
	Basic rule	Regulations	Relaxations	Sanctions		
Description	BBR: balanced budget ER: limited expenditures for personnel	Borrowing allowed if total income is less than the average of the last three years, simultaneously decide redemption plan (5 years) Max. expenditures for personnel at 40% of total expenditures	Higher borrowing allowed in case of natural catastrophes or extraordinary emergencies, simultaneously decide redemption plan (5 years)	A fifth of the Parliament's members, a parliamentary group or the government can take the budget to the constitutional court; Stability Council monitors enforcement, if a budgetary emergency occurs, the Council sets up and monitors the financial restructuring programme		
A Legal base	BBR: constitution Art. 98 (1) sentence 3, LHO Art. 18 (1), ER: constitution Art. 98 (3)	LHO Art. 18 (2) and (3)	LHO Art. 18 (2) and (3)	Constitution Art. 80 (1) No 4; Stability Council: Federal constitution Art. 109a sentence 1 No 2, StabiRatG, VV KonsHilfG Art. 8	13 / 16	0,81
B Enforcement mechanisms				There are no specific sanctions (valid for every bill), the Stability Council only monitors the enforcement but cannot sanction defections or impose corrective measures	1 / 4	0,25
C Coverage						
Official budget:		1,75			1,75 / 4	0,44
- shareholdings		0,75			0,75 / 1	0,75
- debt claims by public authorities		1				
- granted loans		1				
- reserves		1				
Public enterprises		0			0 / 1	0,00
Special funds		0			0 / 1	0,00
Financial support for local authorities		1			1 / 1	1,00
D Flexibility					4 / 4	1,00
Business cycle		1	3		1 / 1	1,00
Economic shocks			1		1 / 1	1,00
Other emergencies			1		1 / 1	1,00
Compensational mechanism			1		1 / 1	1,00
E Content					16 / 20	0,80
Clear definitions	2	6	5	3		
		Borrowing: 2 (specified in HGrG)	Natural catastrophe: 2 (not specified in detail but general understanding, use must be justified)	Legal provisions clearly defined		
		Total income: 2 (definitive numerical value)	Extraordinary emergencies: 1 (not specified, but use must be justified)			
		Redemption plan: 2 (time span not specified)	Redemption plan: 2 (time span not specified)			
		Expenditures for personnel: 2 (numerical value)				
Strict aim		2	2	2	6 / 6	1,00
Strict rule	2	2	1	1	4 / 6	0,67
					6 / 8	0,75
					Sum	35,75 / 48
					Index score	0,66