

Web appendix for

Debt Rule Federalism: The Case of Germany

Erschienen in:

Zeitschrift für Staats- und Europawissenschaften/
Journal of Comparative Government and European Policy

Sarah Ciaglia (Federal Ministry of Finance)

Friedrich Heinemann (ZEW Mannheim and University of Heidelberg)

December 2013

Categories	Part of Rule				Total Points	Std. Points
	Basic rule	Regulations	Relaxations	Sanctions		
Description	BBR: balanced budget	"in principle" no borrowing (considering business cycle developments), deviations are recorded on a control account, decreasing limits for borrowing until 2019; additional tax income used for debt redemption	Borrowing allowed in case of natural catastrophes or extraordinary emergencies, simultaneously decide redemption plan (adequat time span)	A fourth of the Parliament 's members or the government can take the budget to the constitutional court; Stability Council monitors enforcement, if a budgetary emergency occurs, the Council sets up and monitors the financial restructuring programme		
A Legal base	Constitution Art. 79 (1) sentence 2, LHO Art. 18 (1)	Constitution Art. 79, LHO Art. 18 (1 - 5), Coalition Agreement 2011	BBR: constitution Art. 84 sentence 2, LHO Art. 18 (6)	Constitution Art. 68 (2) No 2; Stability Council: Federal constitution Art. 109a sentence 1 No 2, StabiRatG	14 / 16	0.88
B Enforcement mechanisms				There are no specific sanctions (valid for every bill), the Stability Council only monitors the enforcement but cannot sanction defections or impose corrective measures	1 / 4	0.25
C Coverage						
Official budget:		1.5			1.50 / 4	0.38
- shareholdings		0.5			0.5 / 1	0.50
- debt claims by public authorities		1				
- granted loans		0				
- reserves		1				
Public enterprises		0			0 / 1	0.00
Special funds		0			0 / 1	0.00
Financial support for local authorities		1			1 / 1	1.00
D Flexibility						
Business cycle		1	3		4 / 4	1.00
Economic shocks		1			1 / 1	1.00
Other emergencies			1		1 / 1	1.00
Compensational mechanism			1		1 / 1	1.00
E Content						
Clear definitions	1	5	3	3	12 / 20	0.60
		Borrowing: 2 (specified in HGrG)	Natural catastrophe: 2 (not specified in detail but general understanding, use must be justified)	Legal provisions are clearly defined		
		In principle: 2 (control account)	Extraordinary emergencies: 1 (out of the state's control, seriously affecting budget)			
		Business cycle: 2 (tax revenue, "financial transactions")	Redemption plan: 1 (time span not specified)			
		Limits: 2 (decreasing limits for borrowing)				
		Tax income: 2 (specified by term 'tax')				
Strict aim		2	1	2	5 / 6	0.83
Strict rule	1	2	1	0	3 / 6	0.50
		1	1	1	4 / 8	0.50
Sum					32.50 / 48	
Index score						0.62

BY - from 2020 on

Categories	Part of Rule				Total Points	Std. Points
	Basic rule	Regulations	Relaxations	Sanctions		
Description	BBR: balanced budget DR: debt stock of zero in 2030	BBR: "in principle" no borrowing, symmetric adaption to business cycle fluctuations, borrowing up until an amount equal to the amount of expenditures for investments allowed in order to respond to requirements of macroeconomic equilibrium DR: debt stock reduction until 2030	Higher borrowing allowed in order to respond to natural catastrophes, extraordinary emergencies, simultaneously decide a redemption plan (adequat time span) or to disturbance of macroeconomic equilibrium	Majority of the Parliament 's members can take the budget to the constitutional court; Stability Council monitors enforcement, if a budgetary emergency occurs, the Council sets up and monitors the financial restructuring programme		
A Legal base	Constituion Art. 82 (1), BayHo Art. 18(1)	Constitution Art. 82 (1) and (2), BayHO Art. 18 (1) + (2)	Constitution Art. 82 (3), BayHO Art. 18 (3)	GeschO Art 87, Art. 122 (1); Stability Council: Federal constitution Art. 109a sentence 1 No 2, StabiRatG	15 / 16	0.94
B Enforcement mechanisms				There are no specific sanctions (valid for every bill), the Stability Council only monitors the enforcement but cannot sanction defections or impose corrective measures	1 / 4	0.25
C Coverage						
Official budget:		1.75			1.75 / 4	0.44
- shareholdings		0.75			0.75 / 1	0.75
- debt claims by public authorities		1				
- granted loans		1				
- reserves		1				
Public enterprises		0			0 / 1	0.00
Special funds		0			0 / 1	0.00
Financial support for local authorities		1			1 / 1	1.00
D Flexibility						
Business cycle		1		3	4 / 4	1.00
Economic shocks		1			1 / 1	1.00
Other emergencies				1	1 / 1	1.00
Compensational mechanism				1	1 / 1	1.00
E Content						
Clear definitions	2	4	4	3	13 / 20	0.65
		Borrowing: 2 (specified in HGrG)	Natural catastrophe: 2 (not specified in detail but general understanding, use must be justified)	Legal provisions are clearly defined		
		In principle: 2 (referring to business cycle fluctuations)	Extraordinary emergencies: 1 (out of the state's control and serious effect on state's finances, use must be justified)			
		Business cycle: 0 (adaption not specified)	Redemption plan: 1 (adequate time span)			
		Investments: 1 (vague definition in BayHO Art. 13 (3) No 2 sentence 2)	Disturbance of the macroeconomic equilibrium: 0 (not specified)			
		Macroeconomic equilibrium: 0 (not specified)				
		Debt reduction: 1 (debt specified but not way to reduction)				
Strict aim		1	1	2	4 / 6	0.67
Strict rule		1	1	0	2 / 6	0.33
	2	2	2	1	7 / 8	0.88
Sum					34.75 / 48	
Index score						0.66

BE - from 2020 on

Categories	Part of Rule				Total Points	Std. Points
	Basic rule	Regulations	Relaxations	Sanctions		
Description	BBR: balanced budget	If there are no other financial means to cover expenditures, borrowing is allowed up until an amount equal to the amount of expenditures for investments	Borrowing above investments-clause allowed in order to respond to a "disturbance of the macroeconomic equilibrium"	A fourth of the Parliament's members or the government can take the budget to the constitutional court; Stability Council monitors enforcement, if a budgetary emergency occurs, the Council sets up and monitors the financial restructuring programme		
A Legal base	BBR: constitution Art. 87	BBR: constitution Art. 87, LHO Art. 18	BBR: constitution Art. 87, LHO Art. 18	Constitution Art. 84 (2) No 3; Stability Council: Federal constitution Art. 109a sentence 1 No 2, StabiRatG	16 / 16	1.00
B Enforcement mechanisms	4	4	4	4	1 / 4	0.25
C Coverage						
Official budget:		1.75			1.75 / 4	0.44
- shareholdings		0.75			0.75 / 1	0.75
- debt claims by public authorities		1				
- granted loans		1				
- reserves		1				
Public enterprises		0			0 / 1	0.00
Special funds		0			0 / 1	0.00
Financial support for local authorities		1			1 / 1	1.00
D Flexibility					1 / 4	0.25
Business cycle		0		1	0 / 1	0.00
Economic shocks				1	1 / 1	1.00
Other emergencies				0	0 / 1	0.00
Compensational mechanism				0	0 / 1	0.00
E Content	1	2	1	3	7 / 20	0.35
Clear definitions		Borrowing: 2 (specified in HGrG)	Disturbance of the macroeconomic equilibrium: 1 (not specified, but the disturbance and that borrowing will help to repel it must be defined by law)	Legal provisions are clearly defined		
		Investments: 1 (vague definition in LHO Art. 13 (3) No 2 sentence 2)				
Strict aim		2	1	2	5 / 6	0.83
Strict rule	1	0	0	0	0 / 6	0.00
		0	0	1	2 / 8	0.25
Sum					26.75 / 48	
Index score						0.46

Categories	Part of Rule				Total Points	Std. Points
	Basic rule	Regulations	Relaxations	Sanctions		
Description	BBR: Balanced budget	Max. borrowing equal to the amount of expenditures for investments (incl. macroeconomic equilibrium and protection of natural living conditions of present and future generations), less income balanced by less expenditures, debt redemption in economically good times, no new net borrowing from 2016 on	Borrowing above investments-clause allowed in order to respond to a "disturbance of the macroeconomic equilibrium"	A fifth of the Parliament's members or the government can take the budget to the constitutional court; Stability Council monitors enforcement, if a budgetary emergency occurs, the Council sets up and monitors the financial restructuring programme		
A Legal base	Constitution Art. 101 (2) sentence 4 4	Constitution Art. 103 (1) sentence 2 and Art. 101 (1), LHO Art. 18 (1), mid-term financial plan 2012-2016 4	Constitution Art. 103 (1) sentence 3 4	Constitution Art. 68(2) No 2; Stability Council: Federal constitution Art. 109a sentence 1 No 2, StabiRatG 4	16 / 16	1.00
B Enforcement mechanisms				There are no specific sanctions (valid for every bill), the Stability Council only monitors the enforcement but cannot sanction defections or impose corrective measures 1	1 / 4	0.25
C Coverage					1.75 / 4	0.44
Official budget:		1.75			0.75 / 1	0.75
- shareholdings		1				
- debt claims by public authorities		1				
- granted loans		1				
- reserves		0				
Public enterprises		0			0 / 1	0.00
Special funds		0			0 / 1	0.00
Financial support for local authorities		1			1 / 1	1.00
D Flexibility					2 / 4	0.50
Business cycle		1	1		1 / 1	1.00
Economic shocks				1	1 / 1	1.00
Other emergencies				0	0 / 1	0.00
Compensational mechanism				0	0 / 1	0.00
E Content	1	2	1	3	7 / 20	0.35
Clear definitions		Borrowing: 2 (specified in HGrG) Investments: 1 (definition in LHO Art. 13 (3) No 2 sentence 2 and VV-HH 3.2.1.1) Natural living conditions: 0 (not specified) Income: 1 (not sure if LHO Art. 13 (4) sentence 2 applies) Expenditures: 1 (not sure if LHO Art. 13 (4) sentence 2 applies) Economically good times: 0 (not specified)	Disturbance of the macroeconomic equilibrium: 1 (not specified, but the disturbance and that borrowing will help to repel it must be defined by law)	Legal provisions are clearly defined		
Strict aim		1	1	2	4 / 6	0.67
Strict rule	1	0	0	1	1 / 6	0.17
					2 / 8	0.25
					Sum	27.75 / 48
					Index score	0.51

Categories	Part of Rule				Total Points	Std. Points
	Basic rule	Regulations	Relaxations	Sanctions		
Description	BBR: balanced budget	Max. borrowing equal to the amount of expenditures for investments KonsHilfG: numerical limits for structural deficit until 2019	Borrowing above investments-clause allowed in order to respond to a "disturbance of the macroeconomic equilibrium" Structural deficit above limits allowed in case of exceptional situations (must be approved by the Stability Council)	A fifth of the Parliament's members, the government or another institution under public law can take the budget to the constitutional court; Stability Council monitors enforcement, if a budgetary emergency occurs, the Council sets up and monitors the financial restructuring programme Financial Support is cut off if Stability Council considers limits exceeded		
A Legal base	Constitution Art. 131a sentence 2, KonsHilfG Art. 2, VV KonsHilfG Art. 4	Constitution Art. 131a sentence 2, LHO Art. 18 (1), KonsHilfG Art. 2, VV KonsHilfG	Constitution Art. 131a sentence 2, LHO Art. 18 (1), VV KonsHilfG Art. 6	Constitution Art. 140 (1); Stability Council: Federal constitution Art. 109a sentence 1 No 2, StabiRatG, VV KonsHilfG Art. 8	12 / 16	0.75
B Enforcement mechanisms				Financial support is cut off, implicit obligation for corrective measures	3 / 4	0.75
C Coverage					1.75 / 4 0.75 / 1	0.44 0.75
Official budget:						
- shareholdings						
- debt claims by public authorities						
- granted loans						
- reserves						
Public enterprises					0 / 1	0.00
Special funds					0 / 1	0.00
Financial support for local authorities					1 / 1	1.00
D Flexibility					2 / 4	0.50
Business cycle					0 / 1	0.00
Economic shocks					1 / 1	1.00
Other emergencies					1 / 1	1.00
Compensational mechanism					0 / 1	0.00
E Content					15 / 20	0.75
Clear definitions		Borrowing: 2 (specified in HGrG) Investments: 1 (vague definition in LHO Art. 13 (3) No 2 sentence 2) Structural deficit: 2 (clear definition and method for calculation in VV KonsHilfG)	Disturbance of the macroeconomic equilibrium: 0 (not specified) Exceptional situations: 0 (not specified, Stability Council is free to determine a situation as exceptional)	Legal provisions are clearly defined Exceeded limit: 2 (numerical definition, but: vulnerable to interpretation of "exceptional situations")		
Strict aim					2 / 6	0.67
Strict rule					1 / 6	0.67
					2 / 8	0.88
					Sum	33.75 / 48
					Index score	0.64

HB - from 2020 on

Categories	Part of Rule				Total Points	Std. Points
	Basic rule	Regulations	Relaxations	Sanctions		
Description	BBR: balanced budget	Max. borrowing equal to the amount of expenditures for investments	Borrowing above investments-clause allowed in order to respond to a "disturbance of the macroeconomic equilibrium"	A fifth of the Parliament's members, the government or another institution under public law can take the budget to the constitutional court; Stability Council monitors enforcement, if a budgetary emergency occurs, the Council sets up and monitors the financial restructuring programme		
A Legal base	Constitution Art. 131a sentence 2	Constitution Art. 131a sentence 2, LHO Art. 18 (1)	Constitution Art. 131a sentence 2, LHO Art. 18 (1)	Constitution Art. 140 (1); Stability Council: Federal constitution Art. 109a sentence 1 No 2, StabiRatG	16 / 16	1.00
B Enforcement mechanisms				There are no specific sanctions (valid for every bill), the Stability Council only monitors the enforcement but cannot sanction defections or impose corrective measures	1 / 4	0.25
C Coverage					1.75 / 4	0.44
Official budget:		1.75			0.75 / 1	0.75
- shareholdings		0.75				
- debt claims by public authorities		1				
- granted loans		1				
- reserves		1				
Public enterprises		0			0 / 1	0.00
Special funds		0			0 / 1	0.00
Financial support for local authorities		1			1 / 1	1.00
D Flexibility					1 / 4	0.25
Business cycle		0	1		0 / 1	0.00
Economic shocks		0			1 / 1	1.00
Other emergencies			1		0 / 1	0.00
Compensational mechanism			0		0 / 1	0.00
E Content					6 / 20	0.30
Clear definitions	1	2	0	3		
		Borrowing: 2 (specified in HGrG)	Disturbance of the macroeconomic equilibrium: 0 (not specified)	Legal provisions are clearly defined		
		Investments: 1 (vague definition in LHO Art. 13 (3) No 2 sentence 2)				
Strict aim		2	0	2	4 / 6	0.67
Strict rule	1	0	0	0	0 / 6	0.00
		0	0	1	2 / 8	0.25
Sum					25.75 / 48	
Index score						0.45

Categories	Part of Rule				Total Points	Std. Points
	Basic rule	Regulations	Relaxations	Sanctions		
Description	BBR: balanced budget	Max. borrowing equal to the amount of expenditures for investments; until 2019 continuous reduction of the structural deficit, limits for expenditures	Borrowing above investments-clause allowed in case of "extraordinary demands" (LHO: "disturbance of the macroeconomic equilibrium")	A fifth of the Parliament's members or the government can take the budget to the constitutional court; Stability Council monitors enforcement, if a budgetary emergency occurs, the Council sets up and monitors the financial restructuring programme		
A Legal base	Constitution Art. 72 (1)	Constitution Art. 72 (1), LHO Art. 18 (1), FRG	Constitution Art. 72 (1), LHO Art. 18 (1)	Constitution Art. 65 (3) No 3; Stability Council: Federal constitution Art. 109a sentence 1 No 2, StabiRatG	15 / 16	0.94
B Enforcement mechanisms				There are no specific sanctions (valid for every bill), the Stability Council only monitors the enforcement but cannot sanction defections or impose corrective measures	1 / 4	0.25
C Coverage					1.75 / 4	0.44
Official budget:		1.75			0.75 / 1	0.75
- shareholdings		1				
- debt claims by public authorities		1				
- granted loans		1				
- reserves		0				
Public enterprises		0			0 / 1	0.00
Special funds		0			0 / 1	0.00
Financial support for local authorities		1			1 / 1	1.00
D Flexibility					1 / 4	0.25
Business cycle		0			0 / 1	0.00
Economic shocks					1 / 1	1.00
Other emergencies					0 / 1	0.00
Compensational mechanism					0 / 1	0.00
E Content					9 / 20	0.45
Clear definitions	1	5	0	3		
		Borrowing: 2 (specified in HGrG)	Disturbance of the macroeconomic equilibrium: 0 (not specified)	Legal provisions are clearly defined		
		Investments: 1 (vague definition in LHO Art. 13 (3) No 2 sentence 2)				
		Structural deficit: 1 (vague definition in FRG)				
		Limits: 2 (numerically defined in FRG)				
Strict aim		2	0	2	4 / 6	0.67
Strict rule	1	1	0	0	1 / 6	0.17
		2	0	1	4 / 8	0.50
Sum					27.75 / 48	
Index score						0.47

HH - from 2020 on

Categories	Part of Rule				Total Points	Std. Points
	Basic rule	Regulations	Relaxations	Sanctions		
Description	BBR: balanced budget	"in principle" no borrowing, symmetric response to business cycle fluctuations	Borrowing allowed in case of natural catastrophes or extraordinary emergencies, simultaneously decide redemption plan (adequat time span), situation must be defined by a two-thirds parliamentary majority	A fifth of the Parliament´s members or the government can take the budget to the constitutional court; Stability Council monitors enforcement, if a budgetary emergency occurs, the Council sets up and monitors the financial restructuring programme		
A Legal base	Constitution Art. 72 (1) 4	Constitution Art. 72 (1) 4	Constitution Art. 72 (1) 4	Constitution Art. 65 (3) No 3; Stability Council: Federal constitution Art. 109a sentence 1 No 2, StabiRatG 4	16 / 16	1.00
B Enforcement mechanisms				There are no specific sanctions (valid for every bill), the Stability Council only monitors the enforcement but cannot sanction defections or impose corrective measures 1	1 / 4	0.25
C Coverage					1.75 / 4	0.44
Official budget:		1.75			0.75 / 1	0.75
- shareholdings		1				
- debt claims by public authorities		1				
- granted loans		1				
- reserves		0				
Public enterprises		0			0 / 1	0.00
Special funds		0			0 / 1	0.00
Financial support for local authorities		1			1 / 1	1.00
D Flexibility					4 / 4	1.00
Business cycle		1			1 / 1	1.00
Economic shocks				1	1 / 1	1.00
Other emergencies				1	1 / 1	1.00
Compensational mechanism				1	1 / 1	1.00
E Content					13 / 20	0.65
Clear definitions	1	4	5	3		
		Borrowing: 2 (specified in HGrG)	Natural catastrophe: 2 (not specified in detail but general understanding, use must be justified by two-thirds majority)	Legal provisions are clearly defined		
		In principle: 2 (referring to business cycle fluctuations)	Extraordinary emergencies: 2 (term not clear, but use must be justified by two-thirds majority)			
		Business cycle: 1 ("symmetric response" as vague measurement, LHO needed)	Redemption plan: 1 (time span not specified)			
Strict aim		2	2	2	6 / 6	1.00
Strict aim		1	1	0	2 / 6	0.33
Strict rule	1	1	2	1	5 / 8	0.63
Sum					35.75 / 48	
Index score						0.67

Categories	Part of Rule				Total Points	Std. Points
	Basic rule	Regulations	Relaxations	Sanctions		
Description	BBR: balanced budget	Max. borrowing equal to the amount of expenditures for investments	Borrowing above investments-clause allowed in case of "extraordinary demands" and in order to respond to a "disturbance of the macroeconomic equilibrium"	A tenth of the Parliament's members, the government, the prime minister or one hundredth of all people eligible to vote can take the budget to the constitutional court; Stability Council monitors enforcement, if a budgetary emergency occurs, the Council sets up and monitors the financial restructuring programme		
A Legal base	Constitution Art. 141, LHO Art. 18 (1) 4	Constitution Art. 141, LHO Art. 18 (1) 4	Constitution Art. 141, LHO Art. 18 (1) 4	Constitution Art. 131; Stability Council: Federal constitution Art. 109a sentence 1 No 2, StabiRatG 4	16 / 16	1.00
B Enforcement mechanisms				There are no specific sanctions (valid for every bill), the Stability Council only monitors the enforcement but cannot sanction defections or impose corrective measures 1	1 / 4	0.25
C Coverage					1.75 / 4 0.75 / 1	0.44 0.75
Official budget:						
- shareholdings						
- debt claims by public authorities						
- granted loans						
- reserves						
Public enterprises					0 / 1	0.00
Special funds					0 / 1	0.00
Financial support for local authorities					1 / 1	1.00
D Flexibility					2 / 4	0.50
Business cycle					0 / 1	0.00
Economic shocks					1 / 1	1.00
Other emergencies					1 / 1	1.00
Compensational mechanism					0 / 1	0.00
E Content					6 / 20	0.30
Clear definitions	1	2	0	3		
		Borrowing: 2 (specified in HGrG)	Extraordinary demands: 0 (not specified)	Legal provisions are clearly defined		
		Investments: 1 (vague definition in LHO Art. 13 (3) No 2 sentence 2)	Disturbance of the macroeconomic equilibrium: 0 (not specified)			
Strict aim		2	0	2	4 / 6	0.67
Strict rule	1	0	0	0	0 / 6	0.00
		0	0	1	2 / 8	0.25
Sum					26.75 / 48	
Index score						0.50

HE - from 2015 on

Categories	Part of Rule				Total Points	Std. Points
	Basic rule	Regulations	Relaxations	Sanctions		
Description	BBR: balanced budget	"in principle" no borrowing, symmetric adaption to business cycle developments, control account, additional income used for debt redemption or reserves, yearly decreasing amounts of new net borrowing until 2020	Borrowing allowed in case of natural catastrophes or extraordinary emergencies, redemption plan for max. 7 years by 2/3 majority	A tenth of the Parliament's members, the government, the prime minister or one hundredth of all people eligible to vote can take the budget to the constitutional court; Stability Council monitors enforcement, if a budgetary emergency occurs, the Council sets up and monitors the financial restructuring programme		
A Legal base	Constitution Art. 141	Constitution Art. 141, Law implementing Art. 141 of the constitution	Constitution Art. 141, Law implementing Art. 141 of the constitution	Constitution Art. 131; Stability Council: Federal constitution Art. 109a sentence 1 No 2, StabiRatG	14 / 16	0.88
B Enforcement mechanisms				There are no specific sanctions (valid for every bill), the Stability Council only monitors the enforcement but cannot sanction defections or impose corrective measures	1 / 4	0.25
C Coverage						
Official budget:			1		1 / 4	0.25
- shareholdings			0		0 / 1	0.00
- debt claims by public authorities			0			
- granted loans			0			
- reserves			0			
Public enterprises			0		0 / 1	0.00
Special funds			0		0 / 1	0.00
Financial support for local authorities			1		1 / 1	1.00
D Flexibility			1	2	4 / 4	1.00
Business cycle			1		1 / 1	1.00
Economic shocks				1	1 / 1	1.00
Other emergencies				1	1 / 1	1.00
Compensational mechanism				1	1 / 1	1.00
E Content	1	5	6	3	15 / 20	0.75
Clear definitions		Borrowing: 2 (specified in HGrG)	Natural catastrophe: 2 (outside of the state's control, use must be justified by 2/2 majority)	Legal provisions are clearly defined		
		Business cycle: 2 (measurement largely defined, control account)	Extraordinary emergencies: 2 (outside of the state's control, but use must be justified by 2/3 majority)			
		Control account: 2 (clearly defined)	Redemption plan: 2 (7 years)			
		Reduction of new net borrowing: 2 (numerical limits)				
Strict aim		2	2	2	6 / 6	1.00
Strict rule	1	1	2	2	4 / 6	0.67
			2	1	5 / 8	0.63
					Sum	35 / 48
					Index score	0.63

NI

Categories	Part of Rule				Total Points	Std. Points
	Basic rule	Regulations	Relaxations	Sanctions		
Description	BBR: balanced budget	Max. borrowing equal to the amount of expenditures for investments, from 2014 on numerical decreasing limits for borrowing	Borrowing above investments-clause allowed in order to respond to a "disturbance of the macroeconomic equilibrium" or to a threat to "natural living conditions", simultaneously decide redemption plan (adequat time span)	A fifth of the Parliament´s members or the government can take the budget to the constitutional court; Stability Council monitors enforcement, if a budgetary emergency occurs, the Council sets up and monitors the financial restructuring programme		
A Legal base	Constitution Art. 71	Constitution Art. 71 sentence 2, LHO Art. 18a(1) and (2) from 2014 on	Constitution Art. 71 sentence 2, LHO Art. 18a (3)	Constitution Art. 54 sentence 1 No 2, Stability Council: Federal constitution Art. 109a sentence 1 No 2, StabiRatG	14 / 16	0.88
B Enforcement mechanisms				There are no specific sanctions (valid for every bill), the Stability Council only monitors the enforcement but cannot sanction defections or impose corrective measures	1 / 4	0.25
C Coverage					1.75 / 4	0.44
Official budget:					0.75 / 1	0.75
- shareholdings					1	
- debt claims by public authorities					1	
- granted loans					1	
- reserves					0	
Public enterprises					0	0.00
Special funds					0	0.00
Financial support for local authorities					1	1.00
D Flexibility					3 / 4	0.75
Business cycle					0	0.00
Economic shocks					1	1.00
Other emergencies					1	1.00
Compensational mechanism					1	1.00
E Content					9 / 20	0.45
Clear definitions		Borrowing: 2 (specified in HGrG)	Disturbance of the macroeconomic equilibrium: 1 (not specified, but the disturbance and that borrowing will help to repel it must be defined by law)	Legal provisions are clearly defined		
		Investments: 1 (vague definition in LHO Art. 13 (3) No 2 sentence 2)	Natural living conditions: 0 (not specified)			
		Limits: 2 (numerically defined)	Redemption plan: 1 (time span not specified)			
Strict aim					2	0.83
Strict rule					0	0.33
					1	0.25
Sum					28.75 / 48	
Index score						0.55

NI - from 2017 on

Categories	Part of Rule				Total Points	Std. Points
	Basic rule	Regulations	Relaxations	Sanctions		
Description	BBR: balanced budget	"in principle" no borrowing	Borrowing above allowed in order to respond to a "disturbance of the macroeconomic equilibrium" or to a threat to "natural living conditions", simultaneously decide redemption plan (adequat time span)	A fifth of the Parliament's members or the government can take the budget to the constitutional court; Stability Council monitors enforcement, if a budgetary emergency occurs, the Council sets up and monitors the financial restructuring programme		
A Legal base	Constitution Art. 71; LHO Art. 18a (1)	LHO Art. 18a (1)	LHO Art. 18a (3)	Constitution Art. 54 sentence 1 No 2, Stability Council: Federal constitution Art. 109a sentence 1 No 2, StabiRatG	14 / 16	0.88
B Enforcement mechanisms				There are no specific sanctions (valid for every bill), the Stability Council only monitors the enforcement but cannot sanction defections or impose corrective measures	1 / 4	0.25
C Coverage					1.75 / 4	0.44
Official budget:			1.75		0.75 / 1	0.75
- shareholdings			0.75			
- debt claims by public authorities			1			
- granted loans			1			
- reserves			0			
Public enterprises			0		0 / 1	0.00
Special funds			0		0 / 1	0.00
Financial support for local authorities			1		1 / 1	1.00
D Flexibility			0	3	3 / 4	0.75
Business cycle			0		0 / 1	0.00
Economic shocks				1	1 / 1	1.00
Other emergencies				1	1 / 1	1.00
Compensational mechanism				1	1 / 1	1.00
E Content	1	4	3	3	11 / 20	0.55
Clear definitions		Borrowing: 2 (specified in HGrG)	Disturbance of the macroeconomic equilibrium: 1 (not specified, but the disturbance and that borrowing will help to repel it must be defined by law)	Legal provisions are clearly defined		
		In principle: 1 (not specified, but general understanding)	Natural living conditions: 0 (not specified)			
			Redemption plan: 1 (time span not specified)			
Strict aim		2	1	2	5 / 6	0.83
Strict rule	1	1	1	0	2 / 6	0.33
		1	1	1	4 / 8	0.50
Sum					30.75 / 48	
Index score						0.57

MV - from 2020 on

Categories	Part of Rule				Total Points	Std. Points
	Basic rule	Regulations	Relaxations	Sanctions		
Description	BBR: balanced budget	"in principle" no borrowing, symmetric adaption to business cycle fluctuations	Borrowing allowed in order to respond to natural catastrophes and extraordinary emergencies, simultaneously decide a redemption plan (adequat time span)	A third of the Parliament's members or the government can take the budget to the constitutional court; Stability Council monitors enforcement, if a budgetary emergency occurs, the Council sets up and monitors the financial restructuring programme		
A Legal base	Constitution Art. 65 (2) 4	Constitution Art. 65 (2) 4	Constitution Art. 65 (2) 4	Constitution Art. 53 sentence 1 No 2; Stability Council: Federal constitution Art. 109a sentence 1 No 2, StabiRatG 4	16 / 16	1.00
B Enforcement mechanisms				There are no specific sanctions (valid for every bill), the Stability Council only monitors the enforcement but cannot sanction defections or impose corrective measures 1	1 / 4	0.25
C Coverage						
Official budget:		1.75			1.75 / 4	0.44
- shareholdings		0.75			0.75 / 1	0.75
- debt claims by public authorities		1				
- granted loans		1				
- reserves		1				
Public enterprises		0			0 / 1	0.00
Special funds		0			0 / 1	0.00
Financial support for local authorities		1			1 / 1	1.00
D Flexibility						
Business cycle		1	3		4 / 4	1.00
Economic shocks		1			1 / 1	1.00
Other emergencies			1		1 / 1	1.00
Compensational mechanism			1		1 / 1	1.00
E Content						
Clear definitions	1	4	3	3	10 / 20	0.50
		Borrowing: 2 (specified in HGrG)	Natural catastrophe: 2 (not specified in detail but general understanding, use must be justified)	Legal provisions are clearly defined		
		In principle: 2 (referring to business cycle fluctuations)	Extraordinary emergencies: 1 (not specified, but use must be justified)			
		Business cycle: 1 ("symmetric response" as vague measurement, LHO needed)	Redemption plan: 1 (time span not specified)			
Strict aim		2	1	2	5 / 6	0.83
Strict rule		1	1	0	2 / 6	0.33
	1	1	1	1	4 / 8	0.50
Sum					32.75 / 48	
Index score						0.64

Categories	Part of Rule				Total Points	Std. Points
	Basic rule	Regulations	Relaxations	Sanctions		
Description	BBR: balanced budget	Max. borrowing equal to the amount of expenditures for investments	Borrowing above investments-clause allowed in order to respond to a "disturbance of the macroeconomic equilibrium"	A third of the Parliament's members or the government can take the budget to the constitutional court; Stability Council monitors enforcement, if a budgetary emergency occurs, the Council sets up and monitors the financial restructuring programme		
A Legal base	Constitution Art. 83 sentence 2, LHO Art. 18 (1)	Constitution Art. 83 sentence 2, LHO Art. 18 (1)	LHO Art. 18 (1) sentence 2	Constitution Art. 75 sentence 1 No 3, Stability Council: Federal constitution Art. 109a sentence 1 No 2, StabiRatG	15 / 16	0.94
B Enforcement mechanisms				There are no specific sanctions (valid for every bill), the Stability Council only monitors the enforcement but cannot sanction defections or impose corrective measures	1 / 4	0.25
C Coverage					1.75 / 4	0.44
Official budget:		1.75			0.75 / 1	0.75
- shareholdings		0.75				
- debt claims by public authorities		1				
- granted loans		1				
- reserves		0				
Public enterprises		0			0 / 1	0.00
Special funds		0			0 / 1	0.00
Financial support for local authorities		1			1 / 1	1.00
D Flexibility					1 / 4	0.25
Business cycle		0	1		0 / 1	0.00
Economic shocks		0			1 / 1	1.00
Other emergencies			1		0 / 1	0.00
Compensational mechanism			0		0 / 1	0.00
			0		0 / 1	0.00
E Content					7 / 20	0.35
Clear definitions	1	2	1	3		
		Borrowing: 2 (specified in HGrG)	Disturbance of the macroeconomic equilibrium: 1 (not specified, but the disturbance and that borrowing will help to repel it must be defined by law)	Legal provisions are clearly defined		
		Investments: 1 (vague definition in LHO Art. 13 (3) No 2 sentence 2)				
Strict aim		2	1	2	5 / 6	0.83
Strict rule	1	0	0	0	0 / 6	0.00
		0	0	1	2 / 8	0.25
Sum					25.75 / 48	
Index score						0.45

Categories	Part of Rule				Total Points	Std. Points
	Basic rule	Regulations	Relaxations	Sanctions		
Description	BBR: balanced budget	"in principle" no borrowing concerning the "structural" budget, symmetric adaption to business cycle fluctuations	Borrowing allowed in order to respond to natural catastrophes, extraordinary emergencies, max. four-years-long adaptation to legal changes targeting the income or expenditure side of the budget, simultaneously decide a redemption plan (considering business cycle fluctuations); deviations according to the old rule (disturbance of macroeconomic equilibrium) allowed until 2019	The Parliament, a parliamentary group ("Fraktion") or the government can take the budget to the constitutional court; Stability Council monitors enforcement, if a budgetary emergency occurs, the Council sets up and monitors the financial restructuring programme		
A Legal base	Constitution Art. 117; Law on Art. 117 of the constitution Art. 1 (1); LHO Art. 18 (1)	Constitution Art. 117; Law on Art. 117 of the constitution; LHO Art. 18 (1)	Constitution Art. 117; Law on Art. 117 of the constitution; LHO Art. 18 (1)	Constitution Art. 130 (1); Stability Council: Federal constitution Art. 109a sentence 1 No 2, StabiRatG	16 / 16	1.00
B Enforcement mechanisms				There are no specific sanctions (valid for every bill), the Stability Council only monitors the enforcement but cannot sanction defections or impose corrective measures	1 / 4	0.25
C Coverage					2.25 / 4	0.56
Official budget:		2.25			0.25 / 1	0.25
- shareholdings		0				
- debt claims by public authorities		0				
- granted loans		1				
- reserves		0				
Public enterprises		0			0 / 1	0.00
Special funds		1			1 / 1	1.00
Financial support for local authorities		1			1 / 1	1.00
D Flexibility					4 / 4	1.00
Business cycle		1			1 / 1	1.00
Economic shocks					1 / 1	1.00
Other emergencies					1 / 1	1.00
Compensational mechanism					1 / 1	1.00
E Content					13 / 20	0.65
Clear definitions	1	5	4	3		
		Borrowing: 2 (structural deficit)	Natural catastrophe: 2 (not specified in detail but general understanding, use must be justified)	Legal provisions are clearly defined		
		In principle: 2 (referring to business cycle fluctuations)	Extraordinary emergencies: 1 (not specified, but use must be justified)			
		Structural budget: 2 (clearly defined)	Legal changes: 2 (clearly formulated)			
		Business cycle: 2 (defined by LHO and legal act)	Redemption plan: 1 (time span not specified)			
		Control account: 2 (clearly defined)	Disturbance of the macroeconomic equilibrium: 0 (not specified)			
Strict aim		2	1	2	5 / 6	0.83
Strict rule	1	2	1	0	3 / 6	0.50
		1	2	1	5 / 8	0.63
					Sum	36.25 / 48
					Index score	0.69

Categories	Part of Rule				Total Points	Std. Points
	Basic rule	Regulations	Relaxations	Sanctions		
Description	BBR: balanced budget	Max. borrowing equal to the amount of expenditures for investments	Borrowing above investments-clause allowed in order to respond to a "disturbance of the macroeconomic equilibrium" or to "extraordinary demands", redemption plan in case of "extraordinary demands"	A third of the Parliament's members or the government can take the budget to the constitutional court; Stability Council monitors enforcement, if a budgetary emergency occurs, the Council sets up and monitors the financial restructuring programme		
		KonsHilfG: numerical limits for structural deficit until 2019	Structural deficit above limits allowed in case of exceptional situations (must be approved by the Stability Council)	Financial Support is cut off if Stability Council considers limits exceeded		
A Legal base	Constitution Art. 105 (1) sentence 2, KonsHilfG Art. 2, VV KonsHilfG Art. 4	Constitution Art. 108 (2), LHO Art. 18 (1), KonsHilfG Art. 2, VV KonsHilfG	Constitution Art. 108 (2), LHO Art. 18 (1), VV KonsHilfG Art. 6	Constitution Art. 97 sentence 1 No 2; Stability Council: Federal constitution Art. 109a sentence 1 No 2, StabiRatG, VV KonsHilfG Art. 8	12 / 16	0.75
B Enforcement mechanisms				Financial support is cut off, implicit obligation for corrective measures	3 / 4	0.75
C Coverage					1.75 / 4	0.44
Official budget:		1.75			0.75 / 1	0.75
- shareholdings		0.75				
- debt claims by public authorities		1				
- granted loans		1				
- reserves		1				
Public enterprises		0			0 / 1	0.00
Special funds		0			0 / 1	0.00
Financial support for local authorities		1			1 / 1	1.00
D Flexibility					3 / 4	0.75
Business cycle		0	3		0 / 1	0.00
Economic shocks		0		1	1 / 1	1.00
Other emergencies				1	1 / 1	1.00
Compensational mechanism				1	1 / 1	1.00
E Content					16 / 20	0.80
Clear definitions	1	6	4	5		
		Borrowing: 2 (specified in HGrG)	Disturbance of the macroeconomic equilibrium: 1 (not specified, but the disturbance and that borrowing will help to repel it must be defined by law)	Legal provisions are clearly defined		
		Investments: 1 (vague definition in LHO Art. 13 (3) No 2 sentence 2)	Extraordinary demands: 1 (not specified, but the disturbance and that borrowing will help to repel it must be defined by law)	Exceeded limit: 2 (numerical definition, but: vulnerable to interpretation of "exceptional situations")		
		Structural deficit: 2 (clear definition and method for calculation in VV KonsHilfG)	Exceptional situations: 0 (not specified, Stability Council is free to determine a situation as exceptional)			
			Redemption plan: 1 (time span not specified)			
Strict aim			2	2	5 / 6	0.83
Strict rule			2	1	4 / 6	0.67
	1	2	2	2	7 / 8	0.88
					Sum	35.75 / 48
					Index score	0.70

SL - from 2020 on

Categories	Part of Rule				Total Points	Std. Points
	Basic rule	Regulations	Relaxations	Sanctions		
Description	BBR: balanced budget	Max. borrowing equal to the amount of expenditures for investments	Borrowing above investments-clause allowed in order to respond to a "disturbance of the macroeconomic equilibrium" or to "extraordinary demands", redemption plan in case of "extraordinary demands"	A third of the Parliament's members or the government can take the budget to the constitutional court; Stability Council monitors enforcement, if a budgetary emergency occurs, the Council sets up and monitors the financial restructuring programme		
A Legal base	Constitution Art. 105 (1) sentence 2	Constitution Art. 108 (2), LHO Art. 18 (1)	Constitution Art. 108 (2), LHO Art. 18 (1)	Constitution Art. 97 sentence 1 No 2; Stability Council: Federal constitution Art. 109a sentence 1 No 2, StabiRatG	16 / 16	1.00
B Enforcement mechanisms				There are no specific sanctions (valid for every bill), the Stability Council only monitors the enforcement but cannot sanction defections or impose corrective measures	1 / 4	0.25
C Coverage						
Official budget:		1.75			1.75 / 4	0.44
- shareholdings		0.75			0.75 / 1	0.75
- debt claims by public authorities		1				
- granted loans		1				
- reserves		0				
Public enterprises		0			0 / 1	0.00
Special funds		0			0 / 1	0.00
Financial support for local authorities		1			1 / 1	1.00
D Flexibility					3 / 4	0.75
Business cycle		0			0 / 1	0.00
Economic shocks					1 / 1	1.00
Other emergencies					1 / 1	1.00
Compensational mechanism					1 / 1	1.00
E Content					8 / 20	0.40
Clear definitions	1	2	2	3		
		Borrowing: 2 (specified in HGrG)	Disturbance of the macroeconomic equilibrium: 1 (not specified, but the disturbance and that borrowing will help to repel it must be defined by law)	Legal provisions are clearly defined		
		Investments: 1 (vague definition in LHO Art. 13 (3) No 2 sentence 2)	Extraordinary demands: 1 (not specified, but the disturbance and that borrowing will help to repel it must be defined by law)			
			Redemption plan: 1 (time span not specified)			
Strict aim		2	1	2	5 / 6	0.83
Strict rule	1	0	0	0	0 / 6	0.00
		0	1	1	3 / 8	0.38
Sum					29.75 / 48	
Index score						0.57

Categories	Part of Rule				Total Points	Std. Points
	Basic rule	Regulations	Relaxations	Sanctions		
Description	BBR: balanced budget DR: debt stock must decrease	Borrowing allowed in order to respond to business cycle fluctuations, simultaneously decide about redemption plan (adequate time span, latest beginning four years after borrowing) KonsHilfG: numerical limits for structural deficit until 2019 Define yearly (at best constant) amounts for redemption, spend additional tax income on redemption	Higher borrowing allowed in case of natural catastrophes or extraordinary emergencies, simultaneously decide about redemption plan (adequate time span, latest beginning four years after borrowing) Structural deficit above limits allowed in case of exceptional situations (must be approved by the Stabilitv Council)	A fourth of the Parliament 's members or the government can take the budget to the constitutional court; Stability Council monitors enforcement, if a budgetary emergency occurs, the Council sets up and monitors the financial restructuring programme Financial Support is cut off if Stability Council considers limits exceeded		
A Legal base	BBR: constitution Art. 93 (1) sentence 2, LHO Art. 18 (1), KonsHilfG Art. 2, VV KonsHilfG Art. 4; DR: LHO Art. 18 (4) 3	BBR: LHO Art. 18, KonsHilfG Art. 2, VV KonsHilfG; DR: LHO Art. 18 (4) 3	BBR: LHO Art. 18, KonsHilfG Art. 2, VV KonsHilfG; DR: LHO Art. 18 (4) 3	Constitution Art. 75 sentence 1 No 3; Stability Council: Federal constitution Art. 109a sentence 1 No 2, StabiRatG, VV KonsHilfG Art. 8 3	12 / 16	0.75
B Enforcement mechanisms				Financial support is cut off, implicit obligation for corrective measures 3	3 / 4	0.75
C Coverage					1.75 / 4 0.75 / 1	0.44 0.75
Official budget:		1.75				
- shareholdings		0.75				
- debt claims by public authorities		1				
- granted loans		1				
- reserves		0				
Public enterprises		0			0 / 1	0.00
Special funds		0			0 / 1	0.00
Financial support for local authorities		1			1 / 1	1.00
D Flexibility		1	3		4 / 4	1.00
Business cycle		1			1 / 1	1.00
Economic shocks			1		1 / 1	1.00
Other emergencies			1		1 / 1	1.00
Compensational mechanism			1		1 / 1	1.00
E Content	2	6	5	5	18 / 20	0.90
Clear definitions		Borrowing: 2 (structural deficit) Business cycle: 2 (measurement not specified, but use must be justified, LHO needed) Redemption plan: 2 (time span not specified) Structural deficit: 2 (clear definition and method for calculation in VV KonsHilfG) Debt stock decrease: 2 (use of additional tax income specified) 2	Natural catastrophe: 2 (not specified in detail but general understanding, use must be justified) Extraordinary emergencies: 1 (not specified, but use must be justified) Redemption plan: 1 (adequate time span) Exceptional situations: 0 (not specified, Stability Council is free to determine a situation as exceptional) 1	Legal provisions are clearly defined Exceeded limit: 2 (numerical definition, but: vulnerable to interpretation of "exceptional situations") 2	5 / 6	0.83
Strict aim		2	2	1	5 / 6	0.83
Strict rule	2	2	2	2	8 / 8	1.00
					Sum	38.75 / 48
					Index score	0.77

ST - from 2020 on

Categories	Part of Rule				Total Points	Std. Points
	Basic rule	Regulations	Relaxations	Sanctions		
Description	BBR: balanced budget DR: debt stock must decrease	Borrowing allowed in order to respond to business cycle fluctuations, simultaneously decide about redemption plan (adequate time span, latest beginning four years after borrowing) Define yearly (at best constant) amounts for redemption, spend additional tax income on redemption	Higher borrowing allowed in case of natural catastrophes or extraordinary emergencies, simultaneously decide about redemption plan (adequate time span, latest beginning four years after borrowing)	A fourth of the Parliament 's members or the government can take the budget to the constitutional court; Stability Council monitors enforcement, if a budgetary emergency occurs, the Council sets up and monitors the financial restructuring programme		
A Legal base	BBR: constitution Art. 93 (1) sentence 2, LHO Art. 18 (1); DR: LHO Art. 18 (4)	BBR: LHO Art. 18; DR: LHO Art. 18 (4)	BBR: LHO Art. 18; DR: LHO Art. 18 (4)	Constitution Art. 75 sentence 1 No 3; Stability Council: Federal constitution Art. 109a sentence 1 No 2, StabiRatG	13 / 16	0.81
B Enforcement mechanisms				There are no specific sanctions (valid for every bill), the Stability Council only monitors the enforcement but cannot sanction defections or impose corrective measures	1 / 4	0.25
C Coverage						
Official budget:		1.75			1.75 / 4	0.44
- shareholdings		0.75			0.75 / 1	0.75
- debt claims by public authorities		1				
- granted loans		1				
- reserves		0				
Public enterprises		0			0 / 1	0.00
Special funds		0			0 / 1	0.00
Financial support for local authorities		1			1 / 1	1.00
D Flexibility					4 / 4	1.00
Business cycle		1	3		1 / 1	1.00
Economic shocks				1	1 / 1	1.00
Other emergencies				1	1 / 1	1.00
Compensational mechanism				1	1 / 1	1.00
E Content					14 / 20	0.70
Clear definitions		2	5	3	4	
		Borrowing: 2 (structural deficit)	Natural catastrophe: 2 (not specified in detail but general understanding, use must be justified)	Legal provisions are clearly defined		
		Business cycle: 2 (measurement not specified, but use must be justified, LHO needed)	Extraordinary emergencies: 1 (not specified, but use must be justified)			
		Redemption plan: 2 (time span not specified)	Redemption plan: 1 (adequate time span)			
		Debt stock decrease: 2 (use of additional tax income specified)				
Strict aim		2	1	2	5 / 6	0.83
Strict rule		1	1	1	3 / 6	0.50
	2	2	1	1	6 / 8	0.75
Sum					33.75 / 48	
Index score						0.64

Categories	Part of Rule				Total Points	Std. Points
	Basic rule	Regulations	Relaxations	Sanctions		
Description	BBR: balanced budget ER: limited expenditures for personnel	Borrowing allowed if total income is less than the average of the last three years, simultaneously decide redemption plan (5 years), additional income used i.a. for debt redemption Max. expenditures for personnel at 40% of total expenditures	Higher borrowing allowed in case of natural catastrophes or extraordinary emergencies, simultaneously decide redemption plan (5 years)	A fifth of the Parliament's members, a parliamentary group or the government can take the budget to the constitutional court; Stability Council monitors enforcement, if a budgetary emergency occurs, the Council sets up and monitors the financial restructuring programme		
A Legal base	BBR: constitution Art. 98 (1) sentence 3, LHO Art. 18 (1), ER: constitution Art. 98 (3)	LHO Art. 18 (2) and (3), Budget Law Art. 3 (2)	LHO Art. 18 (2) and (3)	Constitution Art. 80 (1) No 4; Stability Council: Federal constitution Art. 109a sentence 1 No 2, StabiRatG, VV KonsHilfG Art. 8	13 / 16	0.81
B Enforcement mechanisms				There are no specific sanctions (valid for every bill), the Stability Council only monitors the enforcement but cannot sanction defections or impose corrective measures	1 / 4	0.25
C Coverage						
Official budget:		1.75			1.75 / 4	0.44
- shareholdings		0.75			0.75 / 1	0.75
- debt claims by public authorities		1				
- granted loans		1				
- reserves		1				
Public enterprises		0			0 / 1	0.00
Special funds		0			0 / 1	0.00
Financial support for local authorities		1			1 / 1	1.00
D Flexibility					4 / 4	1.00
Business cycle		1	3		1 / 1	1.00
Economic shocks			1		1 / 1	1.00
Other emergencies			1		1 / 1	1.00
Compensational mechanism			1		1 / 1	1.00
E Content					16 / 20	0.80
Clear definitions	2	6	5	3		
		Borrowing: 2 (specified in HGrG)	Natural catastrophe: 2 (not specified in detail but general understanding, use must be justified)	Legal provisions clearly defined		
		Total income: 2 (definitive numerical value)	Extraordinary emergencies: 1 (not specified, but use must be justified)			
		Redemption plan: 2 (time span not specified)	Redemption plan: 2 (5 years)			
		Expenditures for personnel: 2 (numerical value)				
		Income: 1 (not sure if LHO Art. 13 (4) No 2 applies)				
Strict aim		2	2	2	6 / 6	1.00
Strict rule	2	2	1	1	4 / 6	0.67
					6 / 8	0.75
Sum					35.75 / 48	
Index score						0.66